

# Unsettled Issues in Remote Operation for On-road Driving Automation

Sven Beiker, PhD

Currently in preview, click to buy full version

# Unsettled Issues in Remote Operation for On-road Driving Automation

**Sven Beiker, PhD**  
*Silicon Valley Mobility*

## EDGE DEVELOPMENT TEAM

---

Richard Bishop, *Bishop Consulting*

Robert Bohn, PhD, *National Institute of Standards and Technology*

Tim Dawkins, *World Economic Forum*

Elliot Katz, JD, *Phantom Auto*

Hendrik Kramer, *Fernride*

Ashish Kundu, PhD, *Cisco Research*

Clare Mutzenich, *Royal Holloway, University of London*

Anand Nandakumar, *Halo*

Edward Straub, *SAE International*

Walter Sullivan, *Designated Driver*

Leanid Tsurankou, *Qibus*

Tao Zhang, PhD, *National Institute of Standards and Technology*





## About the Publisher

SAE International® is a global association of more than 128,000 engineers and related technical experts in the aerospace, automotive, and commercial-vehicle industries. Our core competencies are lifelong learning and voluntary consensus standards development. Visit [sae.org](http://sae.org)

## SAE EDGE™ Research Report Disclaimer

SAE EDGE™ Research Reports focus on topics that are dynamic, in which knowledge is incomplete, and which have yet to be standardized. They represent the collective wisdom of a group of experts and serve as a practical guide to the reader in understanding unsettled subject matter. They are not meant to provide a recommended practice or protocol. The experts have assembled as a community of practitioners to contribute and collectivize their thoughts and points of view. These are not the positions of the institutions or businesses with which they are affiliated, nor is one contributor's perspective advanced over others. SAE EDGE™ Research Reports are the property of SAE International and SAE alone is responsible for their content.

## About This Publication

SAE EDGE™ Research Reports provide state-of-the-art and state-of-the-industry examinations of the most significant topics in mobility engineering. Contributors to SAE EDGE™ Research Reports are experts from academia, government, industry, and research who have come together to explore and define the most critical advancements, challenges, and future direction in areas such as vehicle automation, unmanned aircraft, cybersecurity, advanced propulsion, advanced manufacturing, Internet of Things, connectivity, and quantum technology.

## Related Resources

**SAE EDGE™ Research Report: Unsettled Issues Regarding Visual Communication Between Automated Vehicles and Other Road Users by Sven Beiker, PhD**  
<https://saemobilus.sae.org/content/EPR2021016/>

**SAE EDGE™ Research Report: Unsettled Issues Regarding Communication of Automated Vehicles with Other Road Users by Sven Beiker, PhD**  
<https://saemobilus.sae.org/content/EPR2020023/>

**SAE EDGE™ Research Report: Unsettled Issues Regarding Balancing Virtual, Closed-Course, and Public-Road Testing of Automated Driving Systems by Sven Beiker, PhD**  
<https://saemobilus.sae.org/content/EPR2019011/>

**SAE EDGE™ Research Report: Unsettled Issues in Determining Appropriate Modeling Fidelity for Automated Driving Systems Simulation by Sven Beiker, PhD**  
<https://saemobilus.sae.org/content/EPR2019007/>

**SAE EDGE™ Research Report: Unsettled Topics Concerning Sensors for Automated Road Vehicles by Sven Beiker, PhD**  
<https://saemobilus.sae.org/content/EPR2018001/>

## SAE Team

Frank Marchaca, Chief Growth Officer  
Michael Thompson, Director of Standards, Information, and Research Publications  
Monica Nogueira, Director of Content Acquisition and Development  
Beth Ellen Dibeler, Product Manager  
William Kucinski, Managing Technical Editor

Copyright © 2021 SAE International. All rights reserved.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, distributed, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, without the prior written permission of SAE International. For permission and licensing requests, contact SAE Permissions, 400 Commonwealth Drive, Warrendale, PA 15096-0001 USA; e-mail: [copyright@sae.org](mailto:copyright@sae.org); phone: +1-724-772-4028; fax: +1-724-772-9765.

Printed in USA

Information contained in this work has been obtained by SAE International from sources believed to be reliable. However, neither SAE International nor its authors guarantee the accuracy or completeness of any information published herein and neither SAE International nor its authors shall be responsible for any errors, omissions, or damages arising out of use of this information. This work is published with the understanding that SAE International and its authors are supplying information but are not attempting to render engineering or other professional services. If such services are required, the assistance of an appropriate professional should be sought.

EPR2021028

ISSN 2641-3336

e-ISSN 2641-3334

ISP 03-10686-0415-3

To purchase bulk quantities, please contact: SAE Customer Service

E-mail: [CustomerService@sae.org](mailto:CustomerService@sae.org)

Phone: 877-606-7323 (inside USA and Canada)

+1-724-776-4970 (outside USA)

Fax: +1-724-776-0790

<https://www.sae.org/publications/edge-research-reports>

## About the Editor



**Sven Beiker, PhD**, is the Founder and Managing Director of Silicon Valley Mobility, a mobility consulting and advisory firm that specializes in technical diligence, product roadmaps, and business models for mobility topics. The engagements span start-ups, investors, and corporations in mobility and adjacent industries. In addition, Dr. Beiker is a lecturer at the Graduate School of Business at Stanford University, where he instructs students on strategies for start-ups and corporations in the field of automated, connected, electrified, and shared mobility.

With well over 20 years of experience gained during his tenure at McKinsey and Company, Stanford University, and the BMW Group, Dr. Beiker is dedicated to the future of the automobile and personal mobility. His mission is to improve sustainability, safety, efficiency, and convenience in vehicles and how consumers use them. He combines perspectives from technology, business, policy, and human factors.

Dr. Beiker also serves on advisory boards of several start-ups in the mobility space, as an advisor to the German American Chamber of Commerce in San Francisco, and as an advisor/co-editor to the Lecture Notes in Mobility of Springer Science+Business Media. He is a continuing contributor to the SAE EDGE™ Research Report series.

# contents

## About the Editor

<b>Unsettled Issues in Remote Operation for On-road Driving Automation</b> . . . . .	<b>3</b>
Introduction . . . . .	4
<i>State of the Industry</i> . . . . .	4
Definition of Remote Operation . . . . .	5
Examples for Remote Operation of On-road Vehicles with Driving Automation . . . . .	7
<i>Passenger Transportation</i> . . . . .	8
<i>Freight Transportation</i> . . . . .	10
<i>Lessons Learned from Existing Examples</i> . . . . .	11
Unsettled Issues in Remote Operation for On-road Driving Automation . . . . .	11
<i>Unsolved Technology, Human, Business, and Regulatory Issues</i> . . . . .	11
Communication Link . . . . .	11
Integration and Infrastructure . . . . .	12
Human Factors . . . . .	12
Business . . . . .	13
Regulation . . . . .	14
Use Cases . . . . .	14
<i>Issues of Disagreement</i> . . . . .	15

Taxonomy . . . . .	16
Efficacy . . . . .	16
Significance . . . . .	16
<b>Proposed Solutions to Address Unsettled Issues</b> . . . . .	<b>16</b>
<i>Research</i> . . . . .	16
Technology . . . . .	16
Human Factors . . . . .	17
<i>Industry Alignment</i> . . . . .	18
Communication Link . . . . .	18
Liability . . . . .	19
Interoperability . . . . .	19
Standardization . . . . .	19
Regulation . . . . .	20
<b>Outlook</b> . . . . .	<b>20</b>
<b>Summary</b> . . . . .	<b>21</b>
<i>SAE EDGE™ Research Reports</i> . . . . .	22
<i>Next Steps for Remote Operation for On-road Driving Automation</i> . . . . .	22
<i>Recommendations</i> . . . . .	22
<i>Definitions</i> . . . . .	23
<i>Acknowledgments</i> . . . . .	23
<i>References</i> . . . . .	23
<i>Contact Information</i> . . . . .	25



# Unsettled Issues in Remote Operation for On-road Driving Automation

## Abstract

On-road vehicles equipped with driving automation features are entering the mainstream public space. This category of vehicles is now extending to include those where a human might not be needed for operation on-board. Several pilot programs are underway, and the first permits for commercial usage of vehicles without an onboard operator are being issued. However, questions like “How safe is safe enough?” and “What to do if the system fails?” persist. This is where remote operation comes in, which is an additional layer to the automated driving system where a human assists the so-called “driverless” vehicle in certain situations. Such remote-operation solutions introduce additional challenges and potential risks as the entire chain of “automated vehicle, communication network, and human operator” now needs to work together safely, effectively, and practically.

And as much as there are technical questions regarding network latency, bandwidth, cybersecurity, etc., aspects like human workload, attentiveness, and situational awareness also need to be clarified. Furthermore, on an even higher level, experts still debate the relevance of remote operation to launch automated vehicles—with various expert opinions ranging from they are “essential requirement” to “not advisable.” At the same time, many experts assume that virtually any company aiming for vehicles with SAE level 4 driving automation is considering at least some form of remote operation.

This report aims to highlight those unsettled issues and introduce solutions that are evolving. Similarly, developing standards and regulations are also summarized, which are needed to provide frameworks for the deployment of such driving automation with remote operation.

NOTE: SAE EDGE™ Research Reports are intended to identify and illuminate key issues in emerging, but still unsettled, technologies of interest to the mobility industry. The goal of SAE EDGE™ Research Reports is to stimulate discussion and work in the hope of promoting and speeding resolution of identified issues. These reports are not intended to resolve the challenges they identify or close any topic to further scrutiny.

**SVEN BEIKER, PhD**  
*Silicon Valley Mobility*

## Edge Development Team

Richard Bishop, *Bishop Consulting*  
 Robert Bohn, PhD, *National Institute of Standards and Technology*  
 Tim Dawkins, *World Economic Forum*  
 Elliot Katz, JD, *Phantom Auto*  
 Hendrik Kramer, *Fernride*  
 Ashish Kundu, PhD, *Cisco Research*  
 Clare Mutzenich, *Royal Holloway, University of London*  
 Anand Nandakumar, *Halo*  
 Edward Straub, *SAE International*  
 Walter Sullivan, *Designated Driver*  
 Leanid Tsurankou, *Qibus*  
 Tao Zhang, PhD, *National Institute of Standards and Technology*

ISSN 2640-3536