

**Unsettled Aspects
of Insourcing and
Outsourcing Additive
Manufacturing**

Kevin T. Slattery, DSc

Unsettled Aspects of Insourcing and Outsourcing Additive Manufacturing

Kevin T. Slattery, DSc
The Barnes Global Advisors

EDGE DEVELOPMENT TEAM

Andreas Vlahinos, PhD, *Advanced Engineering Solutions*

Chris Barefoot, *Materials Solutions—A Siemens Energy Business*

Pedrum Sodouri, *Norsk Titanium*

Leo Christodoulou, PhD, *Materials and Manufacturing Innovations*

Derek Denlinger, *Paulo Products*





About the Publisher

SAE International® is a global association of more than 128,000 engineers and related technical experts in the aerospace, automotive, and commercial-vehicle industries. Our core competencies are lifelong learning and voluntary consensus standards development. Visit sae.org

SAE EDGE™ Research Report Disclaimer

SAE EDGE™ Research Reports focus on topics that are dynamic, in which knowledge is incomplete, and which have yet to be standardized. They represent the collective wisdom of a group of experts and serve as a practical guide to the reader in understanding unsettled subject matter. They are not meant to provide a recommended practice or protocol. The experts have assembled as a community of practitioners to contribute and collectivize their thoughts and points of view. These are not the positions of the institutions or businesses with which they are affiliated, nor is one contributor's perspective advanced over others. SAE EDGE™ Research Reports are the property of SAE International and SAE alone is responsible for their content.

About This Publication

SAE EDGE™ Research Reports provide state-of-the-art and state-of-the-industry examinations of the most significant topics in mobility engineering. Contributors to SAE EDGE™ Research Reports are experts from academia, government, industry, and research who have come together to explore and define the most critical advancements, challenges, and future direction in areas such as vehicle automation, unmanned aircraft, cybersecurity, advanced propulsion, advanced manufacturing, Internet of Things, connectivity, and quantum technology.

Related Resources

Unsettled Issues in Additive Manufacturing and Improved Sustainability in the Mobility Industry by Kevin T. Slattery, DSc and Eliana Fu, PhD
<https://saemobilus.sae.org/content/EPR2021015/>

SAE EDGE™ Research Report: Unsettled Topics on the Benefit of Additive Manufacturing for Production at the Point of Use in the Mobility Industry by Kevin T. Slattery, DSc
<https://saemobilus.sae.org/content/EPR2021006/>

SAE EDGE™ Research Report: Unsettled Topics on Surface Finishing of Metallic Powder Bed Fusion Parts in the Mobility Industry by Kevin T. Slattery, DSc
<https://saemobilus.sae.org/content/EPR2021001/>

SAE EDGE™ Research Report: Unsettled Topics on Nondestructive Testing of Additively Manufactured Parts in the Mobility Industry by Kevin T. Slattery, DSc
<https://saemobilus.sae.org/content/EPR2020017/>

SAE EDGE™ Research Report: Unsettled Topics on the Feasibility and Desirability of Using Additive Manufacturing in the Mobility Industry by Kevin T. Slattery, DSc
<https://saemobilus.sae.org/content/EPR2020009/>

SAE Team

Frank Menecaca, Chief Growth Officer
Michael Thompson, Director of Standards, Information, and Research Publications
Monica Roguetea, Director of Content Acquisition and Development
Beth Ellen Hubler, Product Manager
William Macinski, Managing Technical Editor

Copyright © 2021 SAE International. All rights reserved.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, distributed, or transmitted in any form or by any means without the prior written permission of SAE International. For permission and licensing requests, contact SAE Permissions, 400 Commonwealth Drive, Warrendale, PA 15096-0001 USA; e-mail: copyright@sae.org; phone: +1-724-772-4028; fax: +1-724-772-9765.

Printed in USA

Information contained in this work has been obtained by SAE International from sources believed to be reliable. However, neither SAE International nor its authors guarantee the accuracy or completeness of any information published herein and neither SAE International nor its authors shall be responsible for any errors, omissions, or damages arising out of use of this information. This work is published with the understanding that SAE International and its authors are supplying information but are not attempting to render engineering or other professional services. If such services are required, the assistance of an appropriate professional should be sought.

EPR2021023

ISSN 2640-3536

e-ISSN 2640-3544

ISBN 978-1-4605-0380-4

To purchase bulk quantities, please contact: SAE Customer Service

E-mail: CustomerService@sae.org

Phone: 877-606-7323 (inside USA and Canada)

+1-724-776-4970 (outside USA)

Fax: +1-724-776-0790

<https://www.sae.org/publications/edge-research-reports>

About the Editor



Kevin T. Slattery, DSc—Kevin is a Principal ADDvisor® at The Barnes Global Advisors. His primary expertise is in Metallic Additive and Metals Manufacturing, focusing on test program development, process and product verification, qualification, and certification. He has supported over 25 clients on five continents throughout the entire additive manufacturing value chain—from raw material to finished components. He is a 2020 Ambassador for America Makes and was part of the Materials Challenge Silver Medal team in the United States (US) Air Force Rapid Sustainment Office Advanced Manufacturing Olympics.

Kevin was previously Chief Scientist for Additive Manufacturing at Boeing Research and Technology (BR&T). He was responsible for developing and integrating the technology roadmaps and development plans for metallic additive manufacturing for the entire company, along with building and leading a multi-skilled team to execute and deliver the technology throughout the enterprise. Prior to that, he was Chief Scientist for Metals, Ceramics, and Mechanical Systems at BR&T, with the responsibility for portfolio development and coordination, while executing the additive manufacturing portion.

He served as Division Chief Engineer for the US Navy and US Air Force fighter aircraft and US Army rotorcraft in Boeing's primary sustainment organization. From 1997 to 2012, he was on the BR&T Metals Team as a researcher and senior manager, where he primarily developed advanced low-cost titanium-processing

technologies supporting all Boeing products. He was the technical and programmatic lead in implementing the first aerospace metal-additive-manufactured structural aircraft components for both spare and production, with five other first-in-the-industry technology implementations.

He began his career at McDonnell Douglas (now Boeing) as a non-destructive testing engineer, where he developed inspection technologies for metallic and composite components, along with integrating the impact of discontinuities with the acceptance criteria for carbon/epoxy composites.

Dr. Slattery holds a BS and MS in Metallurgical Engineering from the University of Missouri-Rolla (now Missouri S&T) and a DSc in Material Science and Engineering from Washington University in St. Louis. He currently holds 37 US patents, with another 14 applications pending, along with 36 significant publications and conference presentations.

contents

About the Editor

Unsettled Aspects of Insourcing and Outsourcing Additive Manufacturing 3

| | |
|---|-----------|
| Introduction | <u>4</u> |
| <i>State of the Industry</i> | <u>4</u> |
| <i>Unsettled Aspects of Insourcing and Outsourcing AM</i> | <u>4</u> |
| Additive Manufacturing Value Chain | <u>4</u> |
| <i>Design and Engineering</i> | <u>6</u> |
| Feedstock | <u>6</u> |
| Printing | <u>6</u> |
| Post-processing | <u>6</u> |
| Inspection and Acceptance | <u>7</u> |
| Responsibility within the Value Chain | <u>7</u> |
| <i>Recommendations</i> | <u>7</u> |
| Sourcing Options | <u>7</u> |
| <i>Insourcing Everything</i> | <u>7</u> |
| Installed Part Design and Engineering | <u>7</u> |
| Feedstock | <u>7</u> |
| Printing | <u>7</u> |
| Printed Part Design and Engineering | <u>8</u> |
| Post-processing, Inspection, and Acceptance | <u>8</u> |
| <i>Outsourcing Almost Everything</i> | <u>8</u> |
| Installed Part Design and Engineering | <u>8</u> |
| Printed Part Design and Engineering | <u>9</u> |
| Feedstock | <u>9</u> |
| Printing | <u>10</u> |
| Post-processing, Inspection, and Acceptance | <u>10</u> |
| Mixed Sourcing | <u>11</u> |
| <i>Other Sourcing Considerations</i> | <u>11</u> |
| <i>Recommendation</i> | <u>12</u> |
| Example 1: F-12 Duct Made Using L-PBF | <u>12</u> |
| <i>Part Description and Significance</i> | <u>12</u> |
| <i>Comparison of Sourcing Options</i> | <u>13</u> |
| Printed Part Design and Engineering | <u>13</u> |
| Feedstock | <u>14</u> |
| Printing | <u>14</u> |
| Post-processing, Inspection, and Acceptance | <u>14</u> |
| <i>Further Considerations</i> | <u>14</u> |

Example 2: Ti-6Al-4V Structural Part Made Using Large Puddle DED 14

| | |
|---|-----------|
| <i>Part Description and Significance</i> | <u>14</u> |
| <i>Comparison of Sourcing Options</i> | <u>14</u> |
| Printed Part Design and Engineering | <u>15</u> |
| Feedstock | <u>15</u> |
| Printing | <u>15</u> |
| Post-processing, Inspection, and Acceptance | <u>15</u> |
| <i>Further Considerations</i> | <u>15</u> |

Example 3: Ti-6Al-4V Compressor Made Using L-PBF 16

| | |
|---|-----------|
| <i>Part Description and Significance</i> | <u>16</u> |
| <i>Comparison of Sourcing Options</i> | <u>16</u> |
| Printed Part Design and Engineering | <u>17</u> |
| Feedstock | <u>17</u> |
| Printing | <u>17</u> |
| Post-processing, Inspection, and Acceptance | <u>17</u> |
| <i>Further Considerations</i> | <u>18</u> |

Example 4: 316L Engine Block Made Using Binder Jet Additive Manufacturing 19

| | |
|---|-----------|
| <i>Part Description and Significance</i> | <u>19</u> |
| <i>Comparison of Sourcing Options</i> | <u>19</u> |
| Printed Part Design and Engineering | <u>19</u> |
| Feedstock | <u>21</u> |
| Printing | <u>21</u> |
| Post-processing, Inspection, and Acceptance | <u>21</u> |
| <i>Further Considerations</i> | <u>21</u> |

Summary 21

| | |
|---|-----------|
| <i>Wide Range of Insourcing and Outsourcing Options with AM</i> | <u>21</u> |
| <i>SAE EDGE™ Research Reports</i> | <u>21</u> |
| <i>Next Steps for Deciding between Insourcing and Outsourcing of AM</i> | <u>21</u> |
| <i>Recommendations</i> | <u>22</u> |
| <i>Definitions</i> | <u>23</u> |
| <i>Acknowledgments</i> | <u>23</u> |
| <i>Contact Information</i> | <u>23</u> |



Unsettled Aspects of Insourcing and Outsourcing Additive Manufacturing

Abstract

Additive manufacturing (AM), also known as “3D printing,” has transitioned from concepts and prototypes to part-for-part substitution—and now to the creation of part geometries that can only be made using AM. As a wide range of mobility designers and manufacturers begin to introduce AM parts into their products, the question between insourcing and outsourcing the manufacturing of AM parts has surfaced. Just like parts made using other technologies, AM parts can require significant post-processing operations. Therefore, as AM supply chains begin to develop, the sourcing of AM part building and their post-processing becomes an unsettled and important issue.

As the sixth in an ongoing series of SAE EDGE™ Research Reports on AM, the approaches and trade-offs of the different sourcing options for production hardware are discussed in multiple scenarios. While it will focus on metallic components and technologies, which tend to have more post-processing, it will cover these topics for a polymer part as well.

NOTE: SAE EDGE™ Research Reports are intended to identify and illuminate key issues in emerging, but still unsettled, technologies of interest to the mobility industry. The goal of SAE EDGE™ Research Reports is to stimulate discussion and work in the hope of promoting and speeding resolution of identified issues. SAE EDGE™ Research Reports are not intended to resolve the challenges they identify or close any topic to further scrutiny.

Notes on Terminology

Insourcing: The practice of having material or value-added services provided within an organization with the same owners or board of directors; the ultimate authority for dispute resolution is the chief executive officer (this includes obtaining services from other divisions or bureaus with the same overall company)

Original equipment manufacturer (OEM):

Product OEM: Organization that makes the product (e.g., automobile, aircraft, launch vehicle) that is sold (or provides mobility) to the customer

Part OEM: Organization that makes a part that goes into a larger product

Outsourcing: The practice of having material or value-added services provided by an organization with different owners or board of directors; the ultimate authority for dispute resolution is a governmental judiciary

Product: What the using organization purchases from the manufacturer

Product team: The integrated team for a product or a substantial sub-part of a product

Using organization: An organization that uses a product and is concerned with keeping the product operational

KEVIN T. SLATTERY, DSc
The Barnes Global Advisors

EDGE Development Team

Andreas Vlahinos, PhD, *Advanced Engineering Solutions*

Chris Barefoot, *Materials Solutions—A Siemens Energy Business*

Pedrum Sodouri, *Norsk Titanium*

Leo Christodoulou, PhD, *Materials and Manufacturing Innovations*

Derek Denlinger, *Paulo Products*

ISSN 2640-3536