

**Unsettled Issues in
Additive Manufacturing
and Improved
Sustainability in the
Mobility Industry**

Kevin T. Slattery, DSc
Eliana Fu, PhD

Unsettled Issues in Additive Manufacturing and Improved Sustainability in the Mobility Industry

Kevin T. Slattery, DSc

The Edge's Global Advisors

Eliana Fu, PhD

TRUMPF

EDGE DEVELOPMENT TEAM

Roy Adams, *Titanium Metals Corporation (TIMET) (Ret.)*

Steve Camilleri, *SPEE3D*

Bruce Colter, *SPEE3D*

Jay Tiley, PhD, *Oak Ridge National Laboratory*

Thomas Bayha, PhD, *Bayha Materials Research and Consulting, LLC*

Ellen Lee, PhD, *Ford Motor Company*

Sherry Handel, *Additive Manufacturer Green Trade Association*





About the Publisher

SAE International™ is a global association of more than 128,000 engineers and related technical experts in the aerospace, automotive, and commercial-vehicle industries. Our core competencies are lifelong learning and voluntary consensus standards development. Visit sae.org

SAE EDGE™ Research Report Disclaimer

SAE EDGE™ Research Reports focus on topics that are dynamic, in which knowledge is incomplete, and which have yet to be standardized. They represent the collective wisdom of a group of experts and serve as a practical guide to the reader in understanding unsettled subject matter. They are not meant to provide a recommended practice or protocol. The experts have assembled as a community of practitioners to contribute and collectivize their thoughts and points of view. These are not the positions of the institutions or businesses with which they are affiliated, nor is one contributor's perspective advanced over others. SAE EDGE™ Research Reports are the property of SAE International™ and SAE alone is responsible for their content.

About This Publication

SAE EDGE™ Research Reports provide state-of-the-art and state-of-the-industry examinations of the most significant topics in mobility engineering. Contributors to SAE EDGE™ Research Reports are experts from academia, government, industry, and research who have come together to explore and define the most critical advancements, challenges, and future direction in areas such as vehicle automation, unmanned aircraft, cybersecurity,

advanced propulsion, advanced manufacturing, Internet of Things, connectivity, and quantum technology.

Related Resources

SAE EDGE™ Research Report: Unsettled Topics on the Benefit of Additive Manufacturing for Production at the Point of Use in the Mobility Industry by Kevin T. Slattery, DSc
<https://saemobilus.sae.org/content/EPR2021006/>

SAE EDGE™ Research Report: Unsettled Topics on Surface Finishing of Metallic Powder Bed Fusion Parts in the Mobility Industry by Kevin T. Slattery, DSc
<https://saemobilus.sae.org/content/EPR2021001/>

SAE EDGE™ Research Report: Unsettled Topics on Nondestructive Testing of Additive Manufactured Parts in the Mobility Industry by Kevin T. Slattery, DSc
<https://saemobilus.sae.org/content/EPR2020017/>

SAE EDGE™ Research Report: Unsettled Topics on the Feasibility and Desirability of Using Additive Manufacturing in the Mobility Industry by Kevin T. Slattery, DSc
<https://saemobilus.sae.org/content/EPR2020009/>

SAE Team

Frank Ciencinca, Chief Growth Officer

Michael Thompson, Director of Standards, Information, and Research Publications

Monica Nogueira, Director of Content Acquisition and Development

Beth Ellen Dibeler, Product Manager

William Kucinski, Managing Technical Editor

Copyright © 2021 SAE International. All rights reserved.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, distributed, or transmitted in any form or by any means without the prior written permission of SAE International. For permission and licensing requests, contact SAE Permissions, 400 Commonwealth Drive, Warrendale, PA 15096-0001 USA; e-mail: copyright@sae.org; phone: +1-724-772-4028; fax: +1-724-772-9765.

Printed in USA

Information contained in this work has been obtained by SAE International from sources believed to be reliable. However, neither SAE International nor its authors guarantee the accuracy or completeness of any information published herein and neither SAE International nor its authors shall be responsible for any errors, omissions, or damages arising out of use of this information. This work is published with the understanding that SAE International and its authors are supplying information, but are not attempting to render engineering or other professional services. If such services are required, the assistance of an appropriate professional should be sought.

EPR2021015

ISSN 2640-3544

e-ISSN 2640-3544

ISBN 978-1-4605-0347-7

To purchase bulk quantities, please contact: SAE Customer Service

E-mail: CustomerService@sae.org

Phone: 877-606-7323 (inside USA and Canada)

+1-724-776-4970 (outside USA)

Fax: +1-724-776-0790

<https://www.sae.org/publications/edge-research-reports>

About the Editors



Andy Kunkel—Triad Production Group

Kevin T. Slattery, DSc—Kevin is a Principal ADDvisor® at The Barnes Global Advisors (formerly The Barnes Group Advisors). His primary expertise is in Metallic Additive and Metals Manufacturing, focusing on test program development, process and product verification, qualification, and certification. He has supported over 25 clients on five continents throughout the entire additive manufacturing value chain—from raw material to finished components. He is a 2020 Ambassador for America Makes and was part of the Materials Challenge Silver Medal team in the US Air Force Rapid Sustainment Office Advanced Manufacturing Olympics.

Kevin was previously Chief Scientist for Additive Manufacturing at Boeing Research and Technology (BR&T). He was responsible for developing and integrating the technology roadmaps and development plans for metallic additive manufacturing for the entire company, along with building and leading a multi-skilled team to execute and deliver the technology throughout the enterprise. Prior to that, he was Chief Scientist for Metals, Ceramics, and Mechanical Systems at BR&T, with the responsibility for portfolio development and coordination, while executing the additive manufacturing portfolio.

He served as Division Chief Engineer for the US Navy and US Air Force fighter aircraft and US Army rotorcraft in Boeing's military sustainment organization. From 1997 to 2012, he was on the BR&T Metals Team as a researcher and senior manager, where he primarily developed advanced low-cost titanium-processing technologies supporting all Boeing products. He was the technical and program-

matic lead in implementing the first aerospace metal-additive-manufactured structural aircraft components for both spares and production, with five other first-in-the-industry technology implementations.

He began his career at McDonnell Douglas (now Boeing) as a non-destructive testing engineer, where he developed inspection technologies for metallic and composite components, along with increasing the impact of discontinuities with the acceptance criteria for carbon/epoxy composites.

Dr. Slattery holds a BS and MS in Metallurgical Engineering from the University of Missouri-Rolla (now Missouri S&T), and a DSc in Material Science and Engineering from Washington University in St. Louis. He currently holds 37 US patents, with another 14 applications pending; along with 36 significant publications and conference presentations.



(Eliana Fu)

Eliana Fu, PhD—Eliana is Industry Manager of the Aerospace and Medical division at TRUMPF. She is an enthusiastic advocate for additive manufacturing with a strong background in traditional manufacturing. She has a master's degree and PhD in Materials Science and Engineering from Imperial College, University of London. One of her specialties is in traditional titanium manufacturing. Her work experience includes eight years as Research and Development Services Engineer at Titanium Metals Corporation, or "TIMET," as well as time at Firth Rixson and TWI in the United Kingdom. She has spent the last few years working in the space flight industry at SpaceX and, more recently, with Relativity Space, where, as Senior Engineer for Additive Technologies, she immersed herself in the world of three-dimensional (3D) printing and additive manufacturing. She has even been featured in *National Geographic's* six-part "MARS" television miniseries.

She is currently a member of ASTM International's F42.07.02 Technical Subcommittee for Additive Manufacturing for Spaceflight and has participated as an advisor on Mayor of Los Angeles Eric Garcetti's committee on Advanced Manufacturing. She is the ambassador for the new Las Vegas chapter of Women in 3D Printing and a science, technology, engineering, and mathematics (STEM) volunteer for USC Viterbi School's K12 STEM program and regularly participates in other educational STEM outreach programs.

In addition to traditional and additive manufacturing, Eliana's specialties include supplier quality and raw material specifications. She holds Massachusetts Institute of Technology xPro certificates in Additive Manufacturing for Innovative Design and Production (2019) and Leadership Principles for Scientists, Engineers, and Researchers (2020).

contents

About the Editors

Unsettled Issues in Additive Manufacturing and Improved Sustainability in the Mobility Industry 3

Introduction	4
<i>State of the Industry</i>	4
<i>Unsettled Issues in Additive Manufacturing and Improved Sustainability in the Mobility Industry</i>	6

Determining How and Where Metal Additive Manufacturing Technology Will Improve Product Sustainability 6

<i>Additive Manufacturing Value Chain and How to Determine Sustainability</i>	6
<i>Conventional Value Chain and How to Determine Sustainability</i>	9
<i>Recommendations</i>	9

Scenario 1: The High-value, Long-life

Aircraft Part	9
<i>Product and Part Description</i>	9
<i>2020 Sustainability Assessment</i>	10
Part/subsystem Manufacture	10
Part/subsystem Use	14
2040 Sustainability Assessment	15
<i>Recommendations</i>	15

Scenario 2: The Medium-value, Long-life

Aircraft Part	16
<i>Product and Part Description</i>	16
<i>2020 Sustainability Assessment</i>	17
Part/subsystem Manufacture	17
2040 Sustainability Assessment	20

<i>Recommendations</i>	21
------------------------------	----

Scenario 3: The Long-life Automotive Part 21

<i>3D-printed Pistons for the Porsche 911 GT2 RS</i>	21
2020 Sustainability Assessment	23
2040 Sustainability Assessment	23
<i>Recommendations</i>	24

Scenario 4: The High-value, Short-life

Rocket Engine Part 24

<i>Combustion Device for Rocket Propulsion</i>	24
2020 Sustainability Assessment	26
2040 Sustainability Assessment	26
<i>Recommendations</i>	28

Powder Metal Material Concerns 29

<i>Sustainability Implications for Raw Materials, Recycling, and Health</i>	29
<i>Recommendations</i>	30

Summary 30

<i>The Promise of Metal Additive Manufacturing as a Sustainable Technology for the Mobility Industry</i>	30
<i>Guide to Assessing if Metal Additive Manufacturing Can Improve the Sustainability of a Product</i>	31
<i>SAE EDGE Research Reports</i>	32
<i>Next Steps for Additive Manufacturing and Improved Sustainability in the Mobility Industry</i>	33
<i>Recommendations</i>	33
<i>Definitions</i>	33
<i>Acknowledgments</i>	34
<i>References</i>	34
<i>Contact Information</i>	34



Unsettled Issues in Additive Manufacturing and Improved Sustainability in the Mobility Industry

Abstract

Additive manufacturing (AM), also known as “3D printing,” is often touted as a sustainable technology, especially for metallic components, since it produces either net or near-net shapes versus traditionally machined pieces from larger mill products. While machining from rectilinear or cylindrical mill products is often the case in aerospace, most of the metal parts used in the world are made from flat-rolled products and are quite efficient in metal utilization. Additionally, some aspects of the AM value chain, such as the use of powder that falls outside of the desired size for AM, are often not accounted for when determining sustainability. Finally, since the first production AM parts have only recently entered service, the end-of-life aspect of the AM cycle and the impact of AM on the overall sustainability of the system have not yet been demonstrated. Therefore, the primary question regarding the effectiveness of AM as a more sustainable technology for the mobility industry in general, and for a particular product, needs to be asked and answered.

As the fifth in an ongoing series of SAE EDGE™ Research Reports on AM, the overall sustainability of several metallic AM technologies and material combinations—from the feedstock to disposal life cycle—is assessed. Using a series of scenarios, these factors will be compared with parts made using conventional technologies for both the present and future (2040) states.

NOTE: SAE EDGE™ Research Reports are intended to identify and illuminate key issues in emerging, but still unsettled, technologies of interest to the mobility industry. The goal of SAE EDGE™ Research Reports is to stimulate discussion and work in the hope of promoting and speeding resolution of identified issues. These reports are not intended to resolve the challenges they identify or close any topic to further scrutiny.

KEVIN T. SLATTERY, DSc
The Barnes Global Advisors

ELIANA FU, PhD
TRUMPF

EDGE Development Team

Roy Adams, *Titanium Metals Corporation (TIMET) (Ret.)*
Steven Camilleri, *SPEE3D*
Bruce Colter, *SPEE3D*
Jay Tiley, PhD, *Oak Ridge National Laboratory*
Thomas Bayha, PhD, *Bayha Materials Research and Consulting, LLC*
Ellen Lee, PhD, *Ford Motor Company*
Sherry Handel, *Additive Manufacturer Green Trade Association*

ISSN 2640-3536