

**Unsettled Topics on  
Nondestructive Testing of  
Additively Manufactured  
Parts in the Mobility  
Industry**

Kevin T. Slattery, D.Sc

# Unsettled Topics on Nondestructive Testing of Additively Manufactured Parts in the Mobility Industry

**Kevin T. Slattery, D.Sc**  
*The Barnes Global Advisors*

## EDGE DEVELOPMENT TEAM

Anton du Plessis, Ph.D, *Stellenbosch University*

Michael Gierlik, Ph.D, *Federal Aviation Administration*

Dan Johns, *BEAMIT SPA Additive Manufacturing Technologies*

Mick Maher, *Maher & Associates LLC*

Ankit Saharan, Ph.D, *EOS*

Jim Williams, Ph.D, *The Ohio State University (Ret.)*

Dylan Yazbeck, *Jesse Garant Metrology Center*





## About the Publisher

SAE International® is a global association of more than 130,000 engineers and related technical experts in the aerospace, automotive and commercial-vehicle industries. Our core competencies are life-long learning and voluntary consensus standards development. Visit [sae.org](http://sae.org)

## SAE EDGE™ Research Report Disclaimer

SAE EDGE™ Research Reports focus on topics that are dynamic, in which knowledge is incomplete, and which have yet to be standardized. They represent the collective wisdom of a group of experts and serve as a practical guide to the reader in understanding unsettled subject matter. They are not meant to provide a recommended practice or protocol. The experts have assembled as a community of practitioners to contribute and collectivize their thoughts and points of view; these are not the positions of the institutions or businesses with which they are affiliated, nor is one contributor's perspective advanced over other contributors. SAE EDGE™ Research Reports are the property of SAE International and SAE alone is responsible for their content.

## About This Publication

SAE EDGE™ Research Reports provide state-of-the-art and state-of-industry examinations of the most significant topics in mobility engineering. SAE EDGE™ contributors are experts from research, academia, and industry who have come together to explore and define the most critical advancements, challenges, and future direction in areas such as vehicle automation, unmanned aircraft, cybersecurity, advanced propulsion, advanced manufacturing, Internet of Things, and connectivity.

## Related Resources

**SAEMOBILUS® Advanced Manufacturing Knowledge Hub**  
<https://saemobilus.sae.org/advanced-manufacturing/>

## SAE Team

Frank Menchaca, Chief Growth Officer  
Michael Thompson, Director of Standards, Information and Research Publications  
Monica Nogueira, Director of Content Acquisition  
Beth Ellen DeJeter, Product Manager  
William Kucinski, Managing Technical Editor

Copyright © 2020 SAE International. All rights reserved.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, distributed, or transmitted, in any form or by any means without the prior written permission of SAE International. For permission and licensing requests, contact SAE Permissions, 400 Commonwealth Drive, Warrendale, PA 15096-0001 USA; e-mail: [copyright@sae.org](mailto:copyright@sae.org); phone: +1-724-776-4028; fax: +1-724-772-9765.

Printed in USA

Information contained in this work has been obtained by SAE International from sources believed to be reliable. However, neither SAE International nor its authors guarantee the accuracy or completeness of any information published herein and neither SAE International nor its authors shall be responsible for any errors, omissions, or damages arising out of use of this information. This work is published with the understanding that SAE International and its authors are supplying information but are not attempting to render engineering or other professional services. If such services are required, the assistance of an appropriate professional should be sought.

EPR2020017

ISSN 2640-3536

e-ISSN 2640-3544

ISBN 978-1-4606-0209-1

To purchase bulk quantities, please contact: SAE Customer Service

E-mail: [CustomerService@sae.org](mailto:CustomerService@sae.org)

Phone: 877-606-7323 (inside USA and Canada)

+1-724-776-4970 (outside USA)

Fax: +1-724-776-0790

<https://www.sae.org/publications/edge-research-reports>

## About the Editor



Andy Kunkel—Triad Production Group

**Kevin T. Slattery, D.Sc.**—Kevin is a Principal ADDvisor® at The Barnes Global Advisors (formerly The Barnes Group Advisors). His primary expertise is in Metallic Additive and Metals Manufacturing, focusing on test program development, process and product verification, qualification, and certification. He has supported over 25 clients on five continents throughout the entire additive manufacturing value chain—from raw material to finished components.

Kevin was previously the Chief Scientist for Additive Manufacturing at Boeing Research and Technology (BR&T). He was responsible for developing and integrating the technology roadmaps and development plans for the metals additive manufacturing for the entire company, along with building and leading a multi-skilled team to execute and deliver the technology throughout the enterprise. Prior to that, he was the Chief Scientist for Metals, Ceramics, and Mechanical Systems at BR&T, with the responsibility for portfolio development and coordination, while executing the additive manufacturing portion.

He served as the Division Chief Engineer for the US Navy and US Air Force fighter aircraft and US Army rotorcraft in Boeing's Military Sustainment organization. From 1997 to 2012, he was on the BR&T Metals Team as a researcher and senior manager, where he primarily developed advanced low-cost titanium processing technologies supporting all Boeing products. He was the technical and programmatic lead in implementing the first aerospace metal-additive

manufactured structural aircraft components for both spares and production, with five other first-in-the industry technology implementations.

He began his career at McDonnell Douglas (now Boeing) as a non-destructive testing engineer, where he developed inspection technologies for metallic and composite components, along with integrating impact of discontinuities with the acceptance criteria for carbon/epoxy composites.

Dr. Slattery holds BS and MS degrees in Metallurgical Engineering from University of Missouri-Rolla (now Missouri S&T) and a D.Sc in Material Science and Engineering from Washington University in St. Louis. He currently holds 36 US patents, with another 15 applications pending; along with 36 significant publications and conference presentations.

# contents

## About the Editor

### Unsettled Topics on Nondestructive Testing of Additively Manufactured Parts in the Mobility Industry . . . . . 3

Introduction . . . . .	<u>4</u>
<i>State of the Industry</i> . . . . .	<u>4</u>

### Additive Manufacturing Processes and Materials for More Demanding Applications and Discontinuity Types . . . . . 5

<i>The Need to Detect Physical Discontinuities</i> . . . . .	<u>5</u>
<i>Ceramics</i> . . . . .	<u>6</u>
Binder Jet Printing, Material Jetting, and Vat Photopolymerization . . . . .	<u>6</u>
<i>Polymeric Composites</i> . . . . .	<u>8</u>
Material Extrusion . . . . .	<u>8</u>
Vat Photopolymerization and Powder Bed Fusion . . . . .	<u>9</u>
<i>Metals</i> . . . . .	<u>10</u>
Powder Bed Fusion . . . . .	<u>10</u>
Directed Energy Deposition . . . . .	<u>10</u>
Material Extrusion and Binder Jet Printing . . . . .	<u>10</u>
Sheet Lamination . . . . .	<u>11</u>
<i>Recommendations</i> . . . . .	<u>12</u>

### Nondestructive Testing Needs, Methods, and Future Developments . . . . . 13

<i>Ceramics</i> . . . . .	<u>13</u>
Radiographic Methods . . . . .	<u>13</u>

Resonance Methods . . . . .	<u>15</u>
In Situ Inspection . . . . .	<u>15</u>
Recommendations . . . . .	<u>15</u>
<i>Polymeric Composites</i> . . . . .	<u>15</u>
Radiographic Methods . . . . .	<u>16</u>
Ultrasonic Methods . . . . .	<u>16</u>
Thermographic and Strain Optical Methods . . . . .	<u>17</u>
In Situ Inspection . . . . .	<u>18</u>
Recommendations . . . . .	<u>18</u>
<i>Metals</i> . . . . .	<u>18</u>
Surface Inspection Methods and Geometric Complexity . . . . .	<u>19</u>
Fatigue and Fracture Considerations . . . . .	<u>22</u>
Future Developments . . . . .	<u>23</u>
Recommendations . . . . .	<u>23</u>
<i>Summary</i> . . . . .	<u>25</u>
<i>Determining the Need to Perform NDT on Additively Manufactured Parts in the Mobility Industry</i> . . . . .	<u>25</u>
<i>Having the Ability to Perform NDT on Additively Manufactured Parts in the Mobility Industry</i> . . . . .	<u>25</u>
<i>SAE EDGE™ Research Reports</i> . . . . .	<u>25</u>
<i>Next Steps on NDT of AM in the Mobility Industry</i> . . . . .	<u>26</u>
<i>Industry Recommendations</i> . . . . .	<u>27</u>
<i>Definitions</i> . . . . .	<u>27</u>
<i>Acknowledgments</i> . . . . .	<u>28</u>
<i>Reference</i> . . . . .	<u>28</u>
<i>Contact Information</i> . . . . .	<u>28</u>

# Unsettled Topics on Nondestructive Testing of Additively Manufactured Parts in the Mobility Industry

## Abstract

Additive manufacturing (AM) technology, also known as 3D printing, has transitioned from concepts and prototypes to part-for-part substitution and the creation of unique AM-specific part geometries. These AM applications are increasingly present in demanding fields such as medicine and aerospace. Generally, however, the applications are still primarily driven by thermal, stiffness, compression, and static loading conditions. In order to move to the next levels of structural significance (durability and damage tolerance), the AM technologies and components will need to reliably demonstrate freedom from inherent discontinuities that degrade durability to the point of preventing consideration in fatigue environments. This also includes freedom from rogue discontinuities that have the same impact on damage tolerance. Not only will the processes themselves need to be stable, robust, and repeatable enough to minimize the probability of such discontinuities occurring in the first place, but nondestructive testing (NDT) technology and methods will need to be sufficiently capable and reliable to ensure (within a reasonable level of risk) that such discontinuities will be detected to prevent the components from being accepted for use. Finally, while not the focus of this report, they will also be needed to inspect in-service components for damage and the start or growth of fatigue cracks.

As the second installment of a six-part series of SAE EDGE™ Research Reports on AM, this report discusses the need, challenges, technologies, and opportunities for NDT in AM. While it will focus on metallic components and technologies, it will also introduce ceramic and polymer composite components, as these technologies are being developed and implemented in increasingly mission-critical, if not durability and damage tolerance-critical applications.

NOTE: SAE EDGE™ Research Reports are intended to identify and illuminate key issues in emerging, but still unsettled, technologies of interest to the mobility industry. The goal of SAE EDGE™ Research Reports is to stimulate discussion and work in the hope of promoting and speeding resolution of identified issues. SAE EDGE™ Research Reports are not intended to resolve the challenges they identify or close any topic to further scrutiny.

**KEVIN T. SLATTERY, D.Sc**  
*The Barnes Global Advisors*

### Edge Development Team

Anton du Plessis, Ph.D, *Stellenbosch University*

Michael Goerlik, Ph.D, *Federal Aviation Administration*

Dan Johns, *BEAMIT SPA Additive Manufacturing Technologies*

Mick Maher, *Maher & Associates LLC*

Ankit Saharan, Ph.D, *EOS*

Jim Williams, Ph.D, *The Ohio State University (Ret.)*

Dylan Yazbeck, *Jesse Garant Metrology Center*

ISSN 2640-3536