

SAE EDGE™
RESEARCH REPORT

**Unsettled Topics
Concerning Airworthiness
Cybersecurity Regulation**

Aharon David

Currently in preview, click buy full version

Unsettled Topics Concerning Airworthiness Cybersecurity Regulation

Aharon David
AFUZION-InfoSec

EDGE DEVELOPMENT TEAM

Dror Ben-David, *Neural Networks R&D Lab (NRDL) at Matrix*

Daniel DiMase, *Aerocyonics Inc.*

Vance Hilderman, *AFUZION-InfoSec*

Angeliki Karakoliou, *EASA*

Kirsten M. Koepsel, *JD, Indenture, Inc. Aviation Cybersecurity & Counterfeit Parts Expert*

Patrick Mana, *EUROCONTROL*

Daniel Nebenzahl, *Resilience Cyber Security*

Antonio Nogueras, *EUROCONTROL*

Chris Roberts, *Hillbilly Hit Squad*

Cyrille Rosay, *EASA*

Peter Skaves, *FAA Advisor*

Chris Sundberg, *Woodward, Inc.*



About the Publisher

SAE International® is a global association of more than 128,000 engineers and related technical experts in the aerospace, automotive, and commercial vehicle industries. Our core competencies are life-long learning and voluntary consensus standards development. Visit sae.org

SAE EDGE™ Research Report Disclaimer

SAE EDGE™ Research Reports focus on topics that are dynamic, in which knowledge is incomplete, and which have yet to be standardized. They represent the collective wisdom of a group of experts and serve as a practical guide to the reader in understanding unsettled subject matter. They are not meant to provide a recommended practice or protocol. The experts have assembled as a community of practitioners to contribute and collectivize their thoughts and points of view; these are not the positions of the institutions or businesses with which they are affiliated, nor is one contributor's perspective advanced over other contributors. SAE EDGE™ Research Reports are the property of SAE International and SAE alone is responsible for their content.

About This Publication

SAE EDGE™ Research Reports provide state-of-the-art and state-of-industry examinations of the most significant topics in mobility engineering. SAE EDGE™ contributors are experts from research, academia, and industry who have come together to explore and define the most critical advancements, challenges, and future direction in areas such as vehicle automation, unmanned aircraft, cybersecurity, advanced propulsion, advanced manufacturing, Internet of Things and connectivity.

Related Resources

SAE MOBILUS® Cybersecurity Knowledge Hub
<https://saemobilus.sae.org/cybersecurity/>

SAE Team

Frank Menchaca, Chief Growth Officer
Michael Thompson, Director, Standards, Information and Research Publications
Monica Noguera, Content Acquisition Director
Beth Ellison-Beber, Product Manager
William Michalski, Managing Technical Editor

Copyright © 2020 SAE International. All rights reserved.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, distributed, or transmitted, in any form or by any means without the prior written permission of SAE International. For permission and licensing requests, contact SAE Permissions, 400 Commonwealth Drive, Warrendale, PA 15096-0001 USA; e-mail: copyright@sae.org; phone: +1-724-776-4028; fax: +1-724-772-9765.

Printed in USA

Information contained in this work has been obtained by SAE International from sources believed to be reliable. However, neither SAE International nor its authors guarantee the accuracy or completeness of any information published herein and neither SAE International nor its authors shall be responsible for any errors, omissions, or damages arising out of use of this information. This work is published with the understanding that SAE International and its authors are supplying information but are not attempting to render engineering or other professional services. If such services are required, the assistance of an appropriate professional should be sought.

EPR2020013

ISSN 2640-3533

e-ISSN 2640-3541

ISBN 978-1-4606-0100-3

To purchase bulk quantities, please contact: SAE Customer Service

E-mail: CustomerService@sae.org

Phone: 877-606-7323 (inside USA and Canada)

+1-724-776-4970 (outside USA)

Fax: +1-724-776-0790

<https://www.sae.org/publications/edge-research-reports>

About the Editor



Aharon David is a co-founder and partner of AFUZION-InfoSec, a global services, consulting, and training company specializing in aviation cybersecurity certification. He is also a speaker and trainer on aviation cybersecurity certification for organizations such as SAE International, AIAA, IEEE, Aerospace-Tech-Week, and others. He is a member of all US and European standard-making committees for aviation safety-critical electronic systems, cybersecurity, and artificial intelligence (AI), and unmanned aircraft systems (UAS), including SAE's S-18, G-32, and G-34; RTCA's SC-216 and 228; European Organisation for Civil Aviation Equipment's (EUROCAE) WG-72, WG-105, and WG-114; and others.

For the last decade, he has been an advisor to Israeli government authorities, such as the Civilian Air Authority of Israel (CAAI), on subject matters such as UAS, avionics software, cybersecurity, and more.

As an aerospace engineer and an Information Systems/Technology Management MBA with nearly four decades of hands-on engineering management and executive experience with the Israeli Air Force (IAF), Israeli Ministry of Defense (MoD), CAAI, and others, he held such positions as the commander of the IAF's Avionics & Control Software Centre (ACSC) and head of the Israeli Missile Defense Organization's (IMDO) System Engineering & Interoperability Department—among others.

He combines perspectives from technology, business, management of large organizations, civilian and defense, and passenger and UAS aviation development and certification.

contents

About the Editor

Unsettled Topics Concerning

Airworthiness Cybersecurity Regulation	3
Introduction	4
State of the Industry	8
Unsettled Domains Concerning Airworthiness Cybersecurity Regulation	8
Aviation Ecosystem and Beyond:	
“Ecosystem of Ecosystems” Concerns	9
Slow Aviation-at-Large Regulatory Progress	9
Cross-Regulatory Boundaries, Cyber- Attacks, and Security	10
Lacking Mandated Cooperation Among Stakeholders	12
Insufficient Regulatory Progress Outside Commercial-Passenger-Aviation Sector	12
Lacking Regulatory Harmonization with Non-Aviation Ecosystems	12
International Mistrust/Distrust: “Which Side Are You On?”	13
Recommendations	14
OEM Supply Chain Issues	15
Suppliers’ Uncertain Compliance Capability	16
Hardware Cyber-Threats	16
Legacy/COTS Items	16
Insufficient Disclosure Upstream	18
Scoping In/Out—“Mass Extinction?”	18
The Internal Supply Chain	19
Recommendations	19
Regulatory Compliance Challenges	19
“Regulation Is Not Profitable!” + “Cybersecurity Is Not Profitable!” = ?	19
Conflicts with Other Regulatory Frameworks	20
The Safety and Security “Rookie Wall”	20
Listen, Safety Prerequisites	23
How Deep Should Regulatory Documentation Go?	23

How Deep Should Regulators Go?	24
Summary/Recommendations	24

Current Standards/Guidance/Best Practices Gaps	25
Insider Threats	25
Human Factors	26
Non-Technology-Oriented Subjects	26
Resilience	26
Periodic Activities	26
Recertifying After Being Compromised	27
Recommendations	27

Current Standards/Guidance/Best Practices Inherent Dilemmas	27
Simplicity Versus Complexity	28
“Work in Progress”	28
Binary Trust Versus Standard Segmentation	28
The Ever-Evolving Threats	28
“Slow” Safety Versus “Fast” Security	30
Which Risk Assessment Approach to Use?	31
Recommendations	32

Current Standards/Guidance/Best Practices Methodology Uncertainties	33
Process or Requirements?	33
An Open-Ended Methodology?	34
“Enumerating Badness?”	35
What Are the REAL Odds?	35
Federated No More?	35
The Future Looms Large	36
Recommendations	38

Summary/Conclusions	39
Next Steps for Airworthiness Cybersecurity Regulation	39
SAE EDGE™ Research Reports	39
Recommendations	40
Abbreviations/Definitions	41
Acknowledgments	42
References	42
Contact Information	46

Unsettled Topics Concerning Airworthiness Cybersecurity Regulation

Abstract

The certification process of the Boeing 787, starting in 2005, marked a watershed for airworthiness regulation. The “Dreamliner,” the first true “flying data center” could no longer be certified for airworthiness ignoring “sabotage,” like the classic safety regulation for commercial passenger aircraft. Its extensive application of data networks, including enhanced external digital communication, forced the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA), for the first time, to set “Special Conditions” for cybersecurity.

In the 15 years that ensued, airworthiness regulation followed suit, and all key rule-, regulation-, and standard-making organizations weighed in to establish a new airworthiness cybersecurity superset of legislation, regulation, and standardization. The resulting International Civil Aviation Organization (ICAO) resolutions, U.S. and European Union (EU) legislations, FAA and European Aviation Safety Agency (EASA) regulations, and the DO-326/ED-202 set of standards are already the de-facto, and soon becoming the official, standards for legislation, regulation, and best practices, with the FAA already mandating it to a constantly growing extent for a few years now—and EASA adopting the set in its entirety in July 2020. This emerging superset of documents is now carefully studied by all relevant actors—including industry, regulators, and academia—as the aviation ecosystem moves forward with DO-326/ED-202 set training, gap analysis, and even with certification itself.

This report suggests a deeper analysis of these sets of regulatory documents and their effects on the aviation sector as they gradually become the law of the land, starting with their expected effects on the aviation ecosystem, the issues they pose to supply chains, and the challenges they present to the airworthiness certification process itself. Then, this report examines the major DO-326/ED-202 set gaps, inherent dilemmas, and methodological uncertainties. For each such unsettled domain, six aspects are reviewed. Finally, practical solution-seeking processes are proposed, and some specific potential frameworks and solutions are pointed out whenever applicable. It is the intention of this report that these insights and observations would assist regulators, applicants, and standard makers through, at least, the 2020s with accommodating this new regulation and start adjusting it to emerging realities.

NOTE: SAE EDGE™ Research Reports are intended to identify and illuminate key issues in emerging, but still unsettled, technologies of interest to the mobility industry. The goal of SAE EDGE™ Research Reports is to stimulate discussion and work in the hope of promoting and speeding resolution of identified issues. SAE EDGE™ Research Reports are not intended to resolve the challenges they identify or close any topic to further scrutiny.

AHARON DAVID

*Chief WHO (White Hat Officer),
AFUZION-InfoSec*

Edge Development Team

Dror Ben-David, *Neural Networks R&D Lab
(NRDL) at Matrix*
Daniel DiMase, *Aerocyonics Inc.*
Vance Hilderman, *AFUZION-InfoSec*
Angeliki Karakoliou, *EASA*
Kirsten M. Koepsel, JD, *Independent
Aviation Cybersecurity & Counterfeit Parts
Expert*
Patrick Mana, *EUROCONTROL*
Daniel Nebenzahl, *Resilience Cyber Security*
Antonio Noguerras, *EUROCONTROL*
Chris Roberts, *Hillbilly Hit Squad*
Cyrille Rosay, *EASA*
Peter Skaves, *FAA Advisor*
Chris Sundberg, *Woodward, Inc.*

ISSN 2640-3536