

**Unsettled Topics on
the Feasibility and
Desirability of Using
Additive Manufacturing
in the Mobility Industry**

Kevin T. Slattery, DSc

Unsettled Topics on the Feasibility and Desirability of Using Additive Manufacturing in the Mobility Industry

Kevin T. Slattery, DSc
The Barnes Group Advisors

EDGE DEVELOPMENT TEAM

Christopher Alcorn, *The Barnes Group
Advisors*

David Dietrich, PhD, *Honeywell*

Jerry Hall, *Tech Manufacturing*

Ron Daul, *General Motors*

Anthony Rollett, PhD, *Carnegie Mellon
University*

Jennifer Coyne, *Wabtec*





About the Publisher

SAE International® is a global association of more than 128,000 engineers and related technical experts in the aerospace, automotive, and commercial-vehicle industries. Our core competencies are lifelong learning and voluntary consensus standards development. Visit sae.org

SAE EDGE™ Research Report Disclaimer

SAE EDGE™ Research Reports focus on topics that are dynamic, in which knowledge is incomplete, and which have yet to be standardized. They represent the collective wisdom of a group of experts and serve as a practical guide to the reader in understanding unsettled subject matter. They are not meant to provide a recommended practice or protocol. The experts have assembled as a community of practitioners to contribute and collectivize their thoughts and points of view; these are not the positions of the institutions or businesses with which they are affiliated nor is one contributor's perspective advanced over other contributors. SAE EDGE™ Research Reports are the property of SAE International, and SAE alone is responsible for their content.

About This Publication

SAE EDGE™ Research Reports provide state-of-the-art and state-of-the-industry examinations of the most significant topics in mobility engineering. SAE EDGE™ contributors are experts from research, academia, and industry, who have come together to explore and define the most critical advancements, challenges, and future direction in areas such as vehicle automation, unmanned aircraft, cyber security, advanced propulsion, advanced manufacturing, Internet of Things, and connectivity.

Related Resources

SAE MOBILUS® Advanced Manufacturing Hub
<https://saemobilus.sae.org/advanced-manufacturing/>

SAE Team

Frank Menchaca, Chief Product Officer
Michael Thompson, Director, Standards, Information, and Research Publications
Monica Logeira, Acquisitions Director
Beth Ellen Dibeler, Product Manager
William Pucinski, Managing Technical Editor

Copyright © 2020 SAE International. All rights reserved.

No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, distributed, or transmitted in any form or by any means without the prior written permission of SAE International. For permission and licensing requests, contact SAE Permissions, 400 Commonwealth Drive, Warrendale, PA 15096-0001 USA; e-mail: copyright@sae.org; phone: +1-724-772-4028; fax: +1-724-772-9765.

Printed in USA

Information contained in this work has been obtained by SAE International from sources believed to be reliable. However, neither SAE International nor its authors guarantee the accuracy or completeness of any information published herein and neither SAE International nor its authors shall be responsible for any errors, omissions, or damages arising out of use of this information. This work is published with the understanding that SAE International and its authors are supplying information but are not attempting to render engineering or other professional services. If such services are required, the assistance of an appropriate professional should be sought.

EPR2020009

ISSN 2640-3534

e-ISSN 2640-3542

ISBN 978-1-4606-0111-8

To purchase bulk quantities, please contact: SAE Customer Service

E-mail: CustomerService@sae.org

Phone: 877-606-7323 (inside USA and Canada)

+1-724-776-4970 (outside USA)

Fax: +1-724-776-0790

<https://www.sae.org/publications/edge-research-reports>

About the Editor



Andy Kunkel - Triad Production Group

Kevin T. Slattery, DSc - Kevin is a Principal ADDvisor® at The Barnes Group Advisors. His primary expertise is in Metallic Additive and Metals Manufacturing, focusing on test program development, process and product verification, qualification, and certification. He has supported over 25 clients on five continents throughout the entire additive manufacturing value chain from raw material to finished components.

Kevin was previously the Chief Scientist for Additive Manufacturing at Boeing Research and Technology (BR&T). He was responsible for developing and integrating the technical roadmaps and development plans for metallic additive manufacturing for the entire company, along with building and leading a multi-skilled team to execute and deliver the technology throughout the enterprise. Prior to that, he was the Chief Scientist for Metals, Ceramics, and Mechanical Systems at BR&T, with the responsibility for portfolio development and coordination, while executing the additive manufacturing portion.

He served as the Division Chief Engineer for the U.S. Navy and U.S. Air Force fighter aircraft and U.S. Army rotorcraft in Boeing's Military Sustainment organization. From 1997 to 2012, he was on the BR&T Metals Team as a researcher and senior manager, where he primarily developed advanced low-cost titanium-processing technologies supporting all Boeing products. He was the technical and programmatic lead in implementing the first aerospace metal additive-manufactured structural aircraft components for both spares and production, along with five other first-in-industry technology implementations.

He began his career at McDonnell Douglas (now Boeing) as a nondestructive testing engineer, where he developed inspection technologies for metallic and composite components, along with integrating the impact of discontinuities with the acceptance criteria for carbon/epoxy composites.

Dr. Slattery holds BS and MS degrees in Metallurgical Engineering from the University of Missouri-Rolla (now Missouri S&T) and a DSc in Material Science and Engineering from Washington University in St. Louis. He currently holds 36 U.S. patents, with another 15 applications pending, along with 36 significant publications and conference presentations.

contents

About the Editor

Unsettled Topics on the Feasibility and Desirability of Using Additive Manufacturing in the Mobility Industry 3

| | |
|---|-----------|
| Introduction | <u>4</u> |
| <i>The State of Additive Manufacturing in the Mobility Industry</i> | <u>4</u> |
| Material and Process Selection | <u>5</u> |
| <i>Product Requirements</i> | <u>5</u> |
| <i>Vat Photopolymerization</i> | <u>5</u> |
| <i>Material Extrusion</i> | <u>6</u> |
| <i>Sheet Lamination</i> | <u>6</u> |
| <i>Powder Bed Fusion</i> | <u>6</u> |
| <i>Directed-Energy Deposition</i> | <u>9</u> |
| <i>Material Jetting</i> | <u>9</u> |
| <i>Binder Jetting</i> | <u>10</u> |
| <i>Recommendations</i> | <u>10</u> |
| Rationale for Using AM | <u>11</u> |
| <i>Attributes for AM Selection</i> | <u>11</u> |
| <i>Quicker and Lower Cost Concepts and Prototypes</i> | <u>11</u> |
| Progress and Unresolved Issues | <u>11</u> |
| Recommendations | <u>13</u> |
| <i>Quicker and Lower Cost Tooling and Safe Devices</i> | <u>14</u> |
| Progress and Unresolved Issues | <u>14</u> |
| Recommendations | <u>15</u> |
| <i>Short-Run Spares, Repair, and Hard-to-Obtain/Retain Skills</i> | <u>15</u> |
| Progress and Unresolved Issues | <u>15</u> |
| Recommendations | <u>16</u> |
| <i>Cost Reduction</i> | <u>16</u> |
| Progress and Unresolved Issues | <u>16</u> |
| Recommendations | <u>17</u> |
| <i>Mass Customization</i> | <u>17</u> |
| Progress and Unresolved Issues | <u>17</u> |
| Recommendations | <u>17</u> |
| <i>Part-Count Reduction</i> | <u>17</u> |

| | |
|---|-----------|
| Progress and Unresolved Issues | <u>17</u> |
| Recommendations | <u>17</u> |
| <i>Performance Improvements</i> | <u>17</u> |
| Progress and Unresolved Issues | <u>17</u> |
| Recommendations | <u>18</u> |

Trade-offs in Product Design, Development, and Deployment 19

| | |
|---|-----------|
| <i>Trade Space in an Evolving Technology Area</i> | <u>19</u> |
| <i>Nonrecurring Cost</i> | <u>19</u> |
| <i>Recurring Cost</i> | <u>20</u> |
| <i>Lead Time</i> | <u>20</u> |
| <i>Risk</i> | <u>20</u> |
| <i>Performance</i> | <u>20</u> |
| <i>Design Flexibility</i> | <u>21</u> |
| <i>Recommendations</i> | <u>21</u> |

Competing Technologies 21

| | |
|---|-----------|
| <i>Nothing Is Static</i> | <u>21</u> |
| <i>Machining, Robotics, and Numeric Control Programming</i> | <u>21</u> |
| <i>Indirect AM</i> | <u>21</u> |
| <i>Recommendations</i> | <u>22</u> |

Summary 22

| | |
|--|-----------|
| <i>Implementing an Unsettled Technology</i> | <u>22</u> |
| <i>Checklist for Determining Feasibility and Desirability</i> | <u>22</u> |
| <i>Product Team and Organization Recommendations</i> | <u>22</u> |
| <i>SAE EDGE™ Research Reports</i> | <u>23</u> |
| <i>Next Steps on the Feasibility and Desirability of Using Additive Manufacturing in the Mobility Industry</i> | <u>23</u> |
| <i>Industry Recommendations</i> | <u>26</u> |
| <i>Acronyms</i> | <u>26</u> |
| <i>Acknowledgments</i> | <u>26</u> |
| <i>References</i> | <u>26</u> |
| <i>Contact Information</i> | <u>26</u> |

Unsettled Topics on the Feasibility and Desirability of Using Additive Manufacturing in the Mobility Industry

Abstract

Depending on the industry and application, views on additive manufacturing (AM), or “3D printing,” range from something that will transform an industry to it being another overhyped technology that will only find niche applications. Most views fall somewhere in between, with the most common one being that it depends on the application and technology. Because of the ability to directly produce parts from a digital file, views often include dependence on where and when the part is needed. This introduces the crux of the matter, which is how to determine when the use of AM is feasible and desirable, which is made all the more complicated by the fact that not only is AM technology in general changing quickly, but also the merits of the each AM technology relative to the others are also changing. Finally, non-AM technologies are continually improving and are increasingly adding AM-like capability.

As the opening report of a six-part series of SAE EDGE™ Research Reports on AM, this paper discusses unsettled issues pertaining to the benefits, drawbacks, and trade-offs, as well as the decision-making processes to be followed in determining the feasibility and desirability of using AM.

NOTE: SAE EDGE™ Research Reports are intended to identify and illuminate key issues in emerging, but still unsettled, technologies of interest to the mobility industry. The goal of SAE EDGE™ Research Reports is to stimulate discussion and work in the hope of promoting and speeding resolution of identified issues. SAE EDGE™ Research Reports are not intended to resolve the challenges they identify or close any topic to further scrutiny.

Regarding Terminology

- System refers to an end product that serves a unique role to the user (aircraft, automobile, etc.).
- Part refers to an individual component that cannot be taken apart without destroying it (machinings, stampings, weldments, etc.).
- Subsystem refers to a distinct collection of parts within a system (braking, actuation, etc.) or structure (trunk lid, flap, etc.) that have a defined role.
- Subassembly refers to a collection of parts, or a series of parts unitized together, that performs a defined role in a subsystem.

KEVIN T. SLATTERY, DSc
The Barnes Group Advisors

Edge Development Team

Christopher Aldridge, *The Barnes Group Advisors*

David Dietrich, PhD, *Honeywell*

Jerry Halley, *Tech Manufacturing*

Ron Daul, *General Motors*

Anthony Rollett, PhD, *Carnegie Mellon University*

Jennifer Coyne, *Wabtec*

ISSN 2640-3536