

IEEE Guide for Paralleling Regulating Transformers

IEEE Power and Energy Society

Sponsored by the
Transformers Committee

Currently in preview, click buy full version

IEEE Guide for Paralleling Regulating Transformers

Sponsor

Transformers Committee
of the
IEEE Power and Energy Society

Approved 26 March 2015

IEEE-SA Standards Board

Currently in preview, click buy full version

Abstract: Control methods of paralleling regulating transformers are described and compared in this guide. The control methods include: master/follower, circulating current, power factor, circulating reactive current and negative reactance methods. Operating philosophy descriptions, sample wiring diagrams, typical operational variations, the provision of adequate backup protection, and typical misapplication consequences are presented. This guide does not apply to phase-shifting regulating transformers.

Keywords: backup protection, circulating current method, circulating reactive current method, IEEE C57.153™, line current compensation, line drop compensation, master/follower method, negative reactance method, power factor method, tap changer control, transformer loading, transformer paralleling, voltage control

The Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, Inc.
3 Park Avenue, New York, NY 10016-5997, USA

Copyright © 2015 by The Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, Inc.
All rights reserved. Published 30 April 2015. Printed in the United States of America.

IEEE is a registered trademark in the U.S. Patent & Trademark Office, owned by The Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, Incorporated.

PDF: ISBN 978-0-7381-9640-4 STD20176
Print: ISBN 978-0-7381-9641-1 STDPD20176

IEEE prohibits discrimination, harassment, and bullying.

For more information, visit <http://www.ieee.org/web/aboutus/whatis/policies/p9-26.html>.

No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form, in an electronic retrieval system or otherwise, without the prior written permission of the publisher.

Important Notices and Disclaimers Concerning IEEE Standards Documents

IEEE documents are made available for use subject to important notices and legal disclaimers. These notices and disclaimers, or a reference to this page, appear in all standards and may be found under the heading “Important Notice” or “Important Notices and Disclaimers Concerning IEEE Standards Documents.”

Notice and Disclaimer of Liability Concerning the Use of IEEE Standards Documents

IEEE Standards documents (standards, recommended practices, and guides), both full-use and trial-use, are developed within IEEE Societies and the Standards Coordinating Committees of the IEEE Standards Association (“IEEE-SA”) Standards Board. IEEE (“the Institute”) develops its standards through a consensus development process, approved by the American National Standards Institute (“ANSI”), which brings together volunteers representing varied viewpoints and interests to achieve the final product. Volunteers are not necessarily members of the Institute and participate without compensation from IEEE. While IEEE administers the process and establishes rules to promote fairness in the consensus development process, IEEE does not independently evaluate, test, or verify the accuracy of any of the information or the soundness of any judgments contained in its standards.

IEEE does not warrant or represent the accuracy or content of the material contained in its standards, and expressly disclaims all warranties (express, implied and statutory, not included in this or any other document relating to the standard, including, but not limited to, the warranties of: merchantability; fitness for a particular purpose; non-infringement; and quality, accuracy, effectiveness, currency, or completeness of material. In addition, IEEE disclaims any and all conditions relating to: results; and workmanlike effort. IEEE standards documents are supplied “AS IS” and “WITH ALL FAULTS.”

Use of an IEEE standard is wholly voluntary. The existence of an IEEE standard does not imply that there are no other ways to produce, test, measure, purchase, market, or provide other goods and services related to the scope of the IEEE standard. Furthermore, the viewpoint expressed at the time a standard is approved and issued is subject to change brought about through developments in the state of the art and comments received from users of the standard.

In publishing and making its standards available, IEEE is not suggesting or rendering professional or other services for, or on behalf of, any person or entity nor is IEEE undertaking to perform any duty owed by any other person or entity to another. Any person utilizing any IEEE Standards document, should rely upon his or her own independent judgment in the exercise of reasonable care in any given circumstances or, as appropriate, seek the advice of a competent professional in determining the appropriateness of a given IEEE standard.

IN NO EVENT SHALL IEEE BE LIABLE FOR ANY DIRECT, INDIRECT, INCIDENTAL, SPECIAL, EXEMPLARY OR CONSEQUENTIAL DAMAGES (INCLUDING, BUT NOT LIMITED TO: PROCUREMENT OF SUBSTITUTE GOODS OR SERVICES; LOSS OF USE, DATA, OR PROFITS; OR BUSINESS INTERRUPTION) HOWEVER CAUSED AND ON ANY THEORY OF LIABILITY, WHETHER IN CONTRACT, STRICT LIABILITY, OR TORT (INCLUDING NEGLIGENCE OR OTHERWISE) ARISING IN ANY WAY OUT OF THE PUBLICATION, USE OF, OR RELIANCE UPON ANY STANDARD, EVEN IF ADVISED OF THE POSSIBILITY OF SUCH DAMAGE AND REGARDLESS OF WHETHER SUCH DAMAGE WAS FORESEEABLE.

Translations

The IEEE consensus development process involves the review of documents in English only. In the event that an IEEE standard is translated, only the English version published by IEEE should be considered the approved IEEE standard.

Official statements

A statement, written or oral, that is not processed in accordance with the IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual shall not be considered or inferred to be the official position of IEEE or any of its committees and shall not be considered to be, or be relied upon as, a formal position of IEEE. At lectures, symposia, seminars, or educational courses, an individual presenting information on IEEE standards shall make it clear that his or her views should be considered the personal views of that individual rather than the formal position of IEEE.

Comments on standards

Comments for revision of IEEE Standards documents are welcome from any interested party, regardless of membership affiliation with IEEE. However, IEEE does not provide consulting information or advice pertaining to IEEE Standards documents. Suggestions for changes in documents should be in the form of a proposed change of text, together with appropriate supporting comments. Since IEEE standards represent a consensus of concerned interests, it is important that any responses to comments and questions also receive the concurrence of a balance of interests. For this reason, IEEE and the members of its societies and Standards Coordinating Committees are not able to provide an instant response to comments or questions except in those cases where the matter has previously been addressed. For the same reason, IEEE does not respond to interpretation requests. Any person who would like to participate in discussions to an IEEE standard is welcome to join the relevant IEEE working group.

Comments on standards should be submitted to the following address:

Secretary, IEEE-SA Standards Board
445 Hoes Lane
Piscataway, NJ 08854 USA

Laws and regulations

Users of IEEE Standards documents should consult all applicable laws and regulations. Compliance with the provisions of any IEEE Standards document does not imply compliance to any applicable regulatory requirements. Implementers of the standards are responsible for observing or referring to the applicable regulatory requirements. IEEE does not, by the publication of its standards, intend to urge action that is not in compliance with applicable laws, and these documents may not be construed as doing so.

Copyrights

IEEE draft and approved standards are copyrighted by IEEE under U.S. and international copyright laws. They are made available by IEEE and are adopted for a wide variety of both public and private uses. These include both use, by reference, in laws and regulations, and use in private self-regulation, standardization, and the promotion of engineering practices and methods. By making these documents available for use and adoption by public authorities and private users, IEEE does not waive any rights in copyright to the documents.

Photocopies

Subject to payment of the appropriate fee, IEEE will grant users a limited, non-exclusive license to photocopy portions of any individual standard for company or organizational internal use or individual, non-commercial use only. To arrange for payment of licensing fees, please contact Copyright Clearance Center, Customer Service, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923 USA; +1 978 750 8400. Permission to photocopy portions of any individual standard for educational classroom use can also be obtained through the Copyright Clearance Center.

Updating of IEEE Standards documents

Users of IEEE Standards documents should be aware that these documents may be superseded at any time by the issuance of new editions or may be amended from time to time through the issuance of amendments, corrigenda, or errata. An official IEEE document at any point in time consists of the current edition of the document together with any amendments, corrigenda, or errata then in effect.

Every IEEE standard is subjected to review at least every ten years. When a document is more than ten years old and has not undergone a revision process, it is reasonable to conclude that its contents, although still of some value, do not wholly reflect the present state of the art. Users are cautioned to check to determine that they have the latest edition of any IEEE standard.

In order to determine whether a given document is the current edition and whether it has been amended through the issuance of amendments, corrigenda, or errata, visit the IEEE-SA Website at <http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpl/standards.jsp> or contact IEEE at the address listed previously. For more information about the IEEE-SA or IEEE's standards development process, visit the IEEE-SA Website at <http://standards.ieee.org>.

Errata

Errata, if any, for all IEEE standards can be accessed on the IEEE-SA Website at the following URL: <http://standards.ieee.org/findstds/errata/index.html>. Users are encouraged to check this URL for errata periodically.

Patents

Attention is called to the possibility that implementation of this standard may require use of subject matter covered by patent rights. By publication of this standard, no position is taken by the IEEE with respect to the existence or validity of any patent rights in connection therewith. If a patent holder or patent applicant has filed a statement of assurance via an Accepted Letter of Assurance, then the statement is listed on the IEEE-SA Website at <http://standards.ieee.org/about/sasb/patcom/patents.html>. Letters of Assurance may indicate whether the Submitter is willing or unwilling to grant licenses under patent rights without compensation or under reasonable rates, with reasonable terms and conditions that are demonstrably free of any unfair discrimination to applicants desiring to obtain such licenses.

Essential Patent Claims may exist for which a Letter of Assurance has not been received. The IEEE is not responsible for identifying Essential Patent Claims for which a license may be required, for conducting inquiries into the legal validity or scope of Patents Claims, or determining whether any licensing terms or conditions provided in connection with submission of a Letter of Assurance, if any, or in any licensing agreements are reasonable or non-discriminatory. Users of this standard are expressly advised that determination of the validity of any patent rights, and the risk of infringement of such rights, is entirely their own responsibility. Further information may be obtained from the IEEE Standards Association.

Participants

At the time this IEEE guide was completed, the Paralleling Guide Working Group had the following membership:

E. Tom Jauch, *Chair*

James Graham, *Vice Chair*

Mark Tostrud, *Secretary*

Stephen Anthony
Carlo Arpino
Ralph Averitt
Daniel Blaydon
William Boettger
Craig Colopy
James H. Harlow
David Harris
Gary Hoffman
Dallas Jacobsen

Rowland James, Jr.
Derek Johnson
Jinho Kang
Axel Kraemer
Marnie Roussell
Daniel Sauer
Ewald Schweiger
Hemchandra Shertukde
William Solano
Sanjib Som

Markus Stank
Peter Stewart
Joshua Trimble
Kiran Vedante
Karsten Viereck
Krishnamurthy Vijaya
Joe Watson
Samuel Yeung
Murty V. S. Yan
Jennifer Yu

The following members of the individual balloting committee voted on this guide. Balloters may have voted for approval, disapproval, or abstention.

William Ackerman
Samuel Aguirre
Ali Al Awazi
Stephen Antosz
Carlo Arpino
Roberto Asano
Donald Ayers
Peter Balma
Thomas Barnes
George Bartok
Barry Beaster
Philip Beaumont
Robert Beavers
Thomas Beckwith
W. J. (Bill) Bergman
Steven Bezner
Wallace Binder
Thomas Blackburn
Daniel Blaydon
William Bloeth
William Boettger
Paul Boman
Derek Brown
Guido Brunello
Carl Busch
William Eyrd
Thomas Callsen
Paul Cardinal
Arvind Chaudhary
Kurt Clemente
Craig Colopy
Luis Coronado
Randall Crellin

John Crouse
Randall Cunico
Glenn Davis
Dieter Dohnal
Kevin Donahoe
Gary Donnell
Randall Dreyer
Dana Duffield
Frank Elliott
John Fernandez Daher
Joseph Foldi
Marcel Fortin
Doaa Galal
Mel George, V
Frank Gerleve
Ali Ghafourian
Jalal Gohari
Edwin Goodwin
James Graham
Stephen Grier
Randall Groves
Ajit Gwal
James H. Harlow
David Harris
Roger Hayes
Jeffrey Helzer
Reid Herzog
Gary Heuston
Werner Hoelzl
Robert Hoerauf
Gary Hoffman
Philip Hopkinson
Relu Ilie

Mohammad Iman
Dallas Jacobsen
Rowland James, Jr.
E. Tom Jauch
John John
Laszlo Kadar
John Kay
Gael Kennedy
Sheldon Kennedy
Yuri Khersonsky
James Kinney
Gary Kobet
Boris Kogan
Edwin Kramer
David Krause
Jim Kulchisky
Paneendra Kumar B. L.
Saumen Kundu
John Lackey
Chung-Yiu Lam
Thomas La Rose
Raluca Lascu
Albert Livshitz
Thomas Lundquist
Bruce Mackie
J. Dennis Marlow
Lee Matthews
Omar Mazzoni
John Mcalhaney, Jr.
Mark McNally
John Miller
Sujeet Mishra
Daleep Mohla

Joe Mooney
Ryan Musgrove
K. R. M. Nair
Kris K. Neild
Dennis Neitzel
Arthur Neubauer
Michael Newman
Raymond Nicholas
Joe Nims
Lorraine Padden
Mirko Palazzo
Bansi Patel
Shawn Patterson
Brian Penny
Christopher Petrola
Tony Pink
Alvaro Portillo
Iulian Profir
Robert Resuali
Jean-Christophe Riboud

Michael Roberts
Charles Rogers
Oleg Roizman
John Rossetti
Thomas Rozek
Steven Sano
Daniel Sauer
Bartien Sayogo
Dennis Schlender
Robert Schuerger
Ewald Schweiger
Robert Seitz
Nikunj Shah
Hemchandra Shertukde
Charles Simmons
Jerry Smith
Gary Smullin
John Spare
Peter Stewart
K. B. Stump
David Tepen

Malcolm Thaden
Michael Thompson
Mark Tostrud
Demetrios Tziouvaras
Joe Uchiyama
Eric Udren
John Vergis
Jane Verner
John Wang
Daniel Ward
Diane Watkins
Yingli Wen
Kenneth White
Philip Winston
Murty V. V. Yalla
Ray Young
Jennifer Yu
Jian Yu
Kipp Yule
Luis Zambrano

When the IEEE-SA Standards Board approved this guide on 26 March 2015, it had the following membership:

John Kulick, Chair
Jon Walter Rosdahl, Vice Chair
Richard H. Hulett, Past Chair
Konstantinos Karachalios, Secretary

Masayuki Ariyoshi
Ted Burse
Stephen Dukes
Jean-Philippe Faure
J. Travis Griffith
Gary Hoffman
Michael Janezic

Joseph L. Koepfinger*
David J. Law
Hung Lin
Andrew Males
T. V. Olsen
Glenn Parsons
Leonard C. Petersen
Annette D. Reilly

Stephen J. Shellhammer
Adrian P. Stephens
Yatin Trivedi
Phillip Winston
Don Wright
Yu Yuan
Daidi Zhong

*Member Emeritus

Don Messina
IEEE-SA Content Production and Management

Erin Spiewak
IEEE-SA Operational Program Management

Introduction

This introduction is not part of IEEE Std C57.153-2015, IEEE Guide for Paralleling Regulating Transformers.

This guide was prepared by the C57.153 Working Group of the Power Transformers Subcommittee of the Transformers Committee of the IEEE Power and Energy Society.

The intent of this new guide is to present information for the selection and application of transformer paralleling methods used to maintain power system operations. This guide describes paralleling methods in common practice at the time this guide was written and provides information concerning the operational requirements and limitations of each method. Additional information is provided for cases of paralleling transformers with unequal ratings and other operational conditions requiring special considerations.

Contents

| | |
|--|----|
| 1. Overview | 1 |
| 1.1 Scope | 1 |
| 1.2 Purpose | 1 |
| 2. Normative references..... | 1 |
| 3. Definitions, acronyms, and abbreviations | 2 |
| 3.1 Definitions | 2 |
| 3.2 Acronyms and abbreviations | 3 |
| 4. Basic paralleling information | 3 |
| 4.1 General application..... | 3 |
| 4.2 Reasons for paralleled transformer operation..... | 6 |
| 4.3 Basic voltage-control operation..... | 6 |
| 4.4 Effects of off-tap operation..... | 10 |
| 4.5 Consequences of less-than-optimal paralleling operation..... | 14 |
| 4.6 Regulating transformer/system requirements for parallel operation..... | 15 |
| 5. Requirements of the paralleling control system | 16 |
| 5.1 Need for paralleling operation control..... | 16 |
| 5.2 Basic paralleling control requirements | 18 |
| 6. Equipment involved in paralleling..... | 21 |
| 6.1 Regulating transformers..... | 21 |
| 6.2 Step-voltage regulators | 22 |
| 7. Parallel control method choice considerations | 24 |
| 7.1 Paralleled transformer impedance | 24 |
| 7.2 Unequal voltage-regulating tap-sizes and ranges..... | 26 |
| 7.3 Transformers with multiple windings..... | 26 |
| 7.4 Multiple (greater than two) paralleled transformers | 28 |
| 7.5 Source bus configurations..... | 28 |
| 8. Master/follower (MF) paralleling method..... | 29 |
| 8.1 Operating principle | 29 |
| 8.2 Control arrangements..... | 29 |
| 8.3 Settings and sensitivity | 31 |
| 8.4 Backup methods | 32 |
| 8.5 Effects of non-similar transformers/configuration..... | 33 |
| 8.6 Frequent application errors | 37 |
| 9. Power factor (PF) paralleling method..... | 37 |
| 9.1 Operating principle | 37 |
| 9.2 Control arrangements..... | 41 |
| 9.3 Settings and sensitivity | 41 |
| 9.4 Backup methods | 43 |
| 9.5 Effects of non-similar transformer/configuration | 43 |
| 10. Negative (reverse) reactance paralleling method..... | 48 |
| 10.1 Operating principle—control voltage biasing..... | 48 |
| 10.2 Control arrangements..... | 53 |

| | |
|--|----|
| 10.3 Settings and sensitivity | 53 |
| 10.4 Backup methods | 55 |
| 10.5 Effects of non-similar transformer/configuration | 56 |
| 10.6 Frequent application errors | 60 |
| 11. Circulating current (CC) paralleling method | 60 |
| 11.1 Operating principle—control voltage (set point) biasing | 60 |
| 11.2 Control arrangements..... | 62 |
| 11.3 Settings/sensitivity | 64 |
| 11.4 Backup methods | 66 |
| 11.5 Effects of non-similar transformers/configurations | 67 |
| 11.6 Frequent application errors and solutions | 72 |
| 12. Circulating reactive current (CRC) paralleling method..... | 72 |
| 12.1 Operating principle—control voltage (set point) biasing | 72 |
| 12.2 Control arrangements..... | 75 |
| 12.3 Settings/sensitivity..... | 77 |
| 12.4 Backup methods | 79 |
| 12.5 Effects of non-similar transformers/configurations | 80 |
| Annex A (informative) Bibliography | 85 |
| Annex B (informative) Paralleling transformers—impedance issues..... | 86 |
| B.1 Transformers of equal ratings | 86 |
| B.2 Transformers of different ratings | 87 |
| Annex C (informative) Concept of apparent circulating current | 90 |
| C.1 Paralleling issues..... | 90 |
| C.2 Apparent circulating current examples | 91 |

IEEE Guide for Paralleling Regulating Transformers

IMPORTANT NOTICE: IEEE Standards documents are not intended to ensure safety, security, health, or environmental protection, or ensure against interference with or from other devices or networks. Implementers of IEEE Standards documents are responsible for determining and complying with all appropriate safety, security, environmental, health, and interference protection practices and all applicable laws and regulations.

This IEEE document is made available for use subject to important notices and legal disclaimers. These notices and disclaimers appear in all publications containing this document and may be found under the heading “Important Notice” or “Important Notices and Disclaimers Concerning IEEE Documents.” They can also be obtained on request from IEEE or viewed at <http://standards.ieee.org/IPR/disclaimers.html>.

1. Overview

1.1 Scope

This paralleling guide describes and compares control methods of paralleling regulating transformers. The control methods include: master/follower, circulating current, power factor, circulating reactive current, and negative reactance methods. This guide presents operating philosophy descriptions, sample wiring diagrams, typical operational variations, the provision of adequate backup protection, and typical misapplication consequences. This guide does not apply to phase-shifting regulating transformers.

1.2 Purpose

The purpose of this guide is to provide power transformer paralleling users with an easily accessible source for comparing control methods of transformer paralleling. This comparison allows the proper choice of control method and proper operation to best maintain proper system operations. The guide also provides an operational understanding to assist in the analysis of changing system configurations on paralleling operations.

2. Normative references

The following referenced documents are indispensable for the application of this document (i.e., they must be understood and used, so each referenced document is cited in text and its relationship to this document is