

# IEEE Standard for Quality of Experience (QoE) and Visual-Comfort Assessments of Three-Dimensional (3D) Contents Based on Psychophysical Studies

IEEE Computer Society

Sponsored by the  
Standards Activities Board

Currently in preview, click buy full version

# IEEE Standard for Quality of Experience (QoE) and Visual-Comfort Assessments of Three-Dimensional (3D) Contents Based on Psychophysical Studies

Sponsor

**Standards Activities Board  
of the  
IEEE Computer Society**

Approved 26 March 2015

**IEEE-SA Standards Board**

**Abstract:** As the demand and supply for 3D technologies grows, the development of accurate quality-assessment techniques shall be used to develop the 3D display device and signal-processing engine industries. The underlying principles and statistical characteristics of 3D contents based on the human visual system (HVS) are described in this standard. In addition, a reliable 3D subjective assessment methodology that covers the characteristics of human perception, display mechanism, and the viewing environment is introduced in this standard.

**Keywords:** accommodation and vergence conflict, foveation, human visual system, HVS, IEEE 3333.1.1™, QoE, quality assessment, quality of experience, saliency detection, stereoscopic, stereoscopic display, subjective assessment, visual (dis)comfort, visual contents analysis

---

The Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, Inc.  
3 Park Avenue, New York, NY 10016-5997, USA

Copyright © 2015 by The Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, Inc.  
All rights reserved. Published 10 July 2015. Printed in the United States of America.

IEEE is a registered trademark in the U.S. Patent & Trademark Office, owned by The Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, Incorporated.

PDF: ISBN 978-0-7381-9773-9 STD20263  
Print: ISBN 978-0-7381-9774-6 STDPD20263

*IEEE prohibits discrimination, harassment, and bullying.*

For more information, visit <http://www.ieee.org/web/aboutus/whatis/policies/p9-26.html>.

No part of this publication may be reproduced in any form, in an electronic retrieval system or otherwise, without the prior written permission of the publisher.

## Important Notices and Disclaimers Concerning IEEE Standards Documents

IEEE documents are made available for use subject to important notices and legal disclaimers. These notices and disclaimers, or a reference to this page, appear in all standards and may be found under the heading “Important Notice” or “Important Notices and Disclaimers Concerning IEEE Standards Documents.”

### Notice and Disclaimer of Liability Concerning the Use of IEEE Standards Documents

IEEE Standards documents (standards, recommended practices, and guides), both full-use and trial-use, are developed within IEEE Societies and the Standards Coordinating Committees of the IEEE Standards Association (“IEEE-SA”) Standards Board. IEEE (“the Institute”) develops its standards through a consensus development process, approved by the American National Standards Institute (“ANSI”), which brings together volunteers representing varied viewpoints and interests to achieve the final product. Volunteers are not necessarily members of the Institute and participate without compensation from IEEE. While IEEE administers the process and establishes rules to promote fairness in the consensus development process, IEEE does not independently evaluate, test, or verify the accuracy of any of the information or the soundness of any judgments contained in its standards.

IEEE does not warrant or represent the accuracy or content of the material contained in its standards, and expressly disclaims all warranties (express, implied and statutory) not included in this or any other document relating to the standard, including, but not limited to, the warranties of: merchantability; fitness for a particular purpose; non-infringement; and quality, accuracy, effectiveness, currency, or completeness of material. In addition, IEEE disclaims any and all conditions relating to: results; and workmanlike effort. IEEE standards documents are supplied “AS IS” and “WITH ALL FAULTS.”

Use of an IEEE standard is wholly voluntary. The existence of an IEEE standard does not imply that there are no other ways to produce, test, measure, purchase, make, or provide other goods and services related to the scope of the IEEE standard. Furthermore, the viewpoint expressed at the time a standard is approved and issued is subject to change brought about through developments in the state of the art and comments received from users of the standard.

In publishing and making its standards available, IEEE is not suggesting or rendering professional or other services for, or on behalf of, any person or entity nor is IEEE undertaking to perform any duty owed by any other person or entity to another. Any person utilizing any IEEE Standards document, should rely upon his or her own independent judgment in the exercise of reasonable care in any given circumstances or, as appropriate, seek the advice of a competent professional in determining the appropriateness of a given IEEE standard.

IN NO EVENT SHALL IEEE BE LIABLE FOR ANY DIRECT, INDIRECT, INCIDENTAL, SPECIAL, EXEMPLARY, OR CONSEQUENTIAL DAMAGES (INCLUDING, BUT NOT LIMITED TO: PROCUREMENT OF SUBSTITUTE GOODS OR SERVICES; LOSS OF USE, DATA, OR PROFITS; OR BUSINESS INTERRUPTION) HOWEVER CAUSED AND ON ANY THEORY OF LIABILITY, WHETHER IN CONTRACT, STRICT LIABILITY, OR TORT (INCLUDING NEGLIGENCE OR OTHERWISE) ARISING IN ANY WAY OUT OF THE PUBLICATION, USE OF, OR RELIANCE UPON ANY STANDARD, EVEN IF ADVISED OF THE POSSIBILITY OF SUCH DAMAGE AND REGARDLESS OF WHETHER SUCH DAMAGE WAS FORESEEABLE.

### Translations

The IEEE consensus development process involves the review of documents in English only. In the event that an IEEE standard is translated, only the English version published by IEEE should be considered the approved IEEE standard.

## Official statements

A statement, written or oral, that is not processed in accordance with the IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual shall not be considered or inferred to be the official position of IEEE or any of its committees and shall not be considered to be, or be relied upon as, a formal position of IEEE. At lectures, symposia, seminars, or educational courses, an individual presenting information on IEEE standards shall make it clear that his or her views should be considered the personal views of that individual rather than the formal position of IEEE.

## Comments on standards

Comments for revision of IEEE Standards documents are welcome from any interested party, regardless of membership affiliation with IEEE. However, IEEE does not provide consulting information or advice pertaining to IEEE Standards documents. Suggestions for changes in documents should be in the form of a proposed change of text, together with appropriate supporting comments. Since IEEE standards represent a consensus of concerned interests, it is important that any responses to comments and questions also receive the concurrence of a balance of interests. For this reason, IEEE and the members of its societies and Standards Coordinating Committees are not able to provide an instant response to comment or questions except in those cases where the matter has previously been addressed. For the same reason, IEEE does not respond to interpretation requests. Any person who would like to participate in revisions to an IEEE standard is welcome to join the relevant IEEE working group.

Comments on standards should be submitted to the following address:

Secretary, IEEE-SA Standards Board  
445 Hoes Lane  
Piscataway, NJ 08854 USA

## Laws and regulations

Users of IEEE Standards documents should consult all applicable laws and regulations. Compliance with the provisions of any IEEE Standards document does not imply compliance to any applicable regulatory requirements. Implementers of the standards are responsible for observing or referring to the applicable regulatory requirements. IEEE does not, by the publication of its standards, intend to urge action that is not in compliance with applicable laws, and these documents may not be construed as doing so.

## Copyrights

IEEE draft and approved standards are copyrighted by IEEE under U.S. and international copyright laws. They are made available by IEEE and are adopted for a wide variety of both public and private uses. These include both use by reference, in laws and regulations, and use in private self-regulation, standardization, and the promotion of engineering practices and methods. By making these documents available for use and adoption by public authorities and private users, IEEE does not waive any rights in copyright to the documents.

## Photocopies

Subject to payment of the appropriate fee, IEEE will grant users a limited, non-exclusive license to photocopy portions of any individual standard for company or organizational internal use or individual, non-commercial use only. To arrange for payment of licensing fees, please contact Copyright Clearance Center, Customer Service, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923 USA; +1 978 750 8400. Permission to photocopy portions of any individual standard for educational classroom use can also be obtained through the Copyright Clearance Center.

## Updating of IEEE Standards documents

Users of IEEE Standards documents should be aware that these documents may be superseded at any time by the issuance of new editions or may be amended from time to time through the issuance of amendments, corrigenda, or errata. An official IEEE document at any point in time consists of the current edition of the document together with any amendments, corrigenda, or errata then in effect.

Every IEEE standard is subjected to review at least every ten years. When a document is more than ten years old and has not undergone a revision process, it is reasonable to conclude that its contents, although still of some value, do not wholly reflect the present state of the art. Users are cautioned to check to determine that they have the latest edition of any IEEE standard.

In order to determine whether a given document is the current edition and whether it has been amended through the issuance of amendments, corrigenda, or errata, visit the IEEE-SA Website at <http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpl/standards.jsp> or contact IEEE at the address listed previously. For more information about the IEEE-SA or IEEE's standards development process, visit the IEEE-SA Website at <http://standards.ieee.org>.

### Errata

Errata, if any, for all IEEE standards can be accessed on the IEEE-SA Website at the following URL: <http://standards.ieee.org/findstds/errata/index.html>. Users are encouraged to check this URL for errata periodically.

### Patents

Attention is called to the possibility that implementation of this standard may require use of subject matter covered by patent rights. By publication of this standard, no position is taken by the IEEE with respect to the existence or validity of any patent rights in connection therewith. If a patent holder or patent applicant has filed a statement of assurance via an Accepted Letter of Assurance, then the statement is listed on the IEEE-SA Website at <http://standards.ieee.org/about/sasb/patcom/patents.html>. Letters of Assurance may indicate whether the Submitter is willing or unwilling to grant licenses under patent rights without compensation or under reasonable rates, with reasonable terms and conditions that are demonstrably free of any unfair discrimination to applicants desiring to obtain such licenses.

Essential Patent Claims may exist for which a Letter of Assurance has not been received. The IEEE is not responsible for identifying Essential Patent Claims for which a license may be required, for conducting inquiries into the legal validity or scope of Patents Claims, or determining whether any licensing terms or conditions provided in connection with submission of a Letter of Assurance, if any, or in any licensing agreements are reasonable or non-discriminatory. Users of this standard are expressly advised that determination of the validity of any patent rights, and the risk of infringement of such rights, is entirely their own responsibility. Further information may be obtained from the IEEE Standards Association.

## Participants

At the time this IEEE standard was completed, the 3D Human Factors Working Group had the following membership:

### **Sanghoon Lee, Chair**

Sungcho Cho  
Ricky Christanto  
Seunghan Han  
Huychan Jung  
Sangkwon Jung

Seongyong Kim  
Taewan Kim  
JaeKeun Kwak  
Patrick Le Callet

Jaeun Lee  
Jongmuk Lee  
Sangeun Lee  
Jing Li  
An Ping

The following members of the individual balloting committee voted on this standard. Balloters may have voted for approval, disapproval, or abstention.

Ping An  
Susan Burgess  
Juan Carreon  
Keith Chow  
P. Eastman  
Randall Groves  
Werner Hoelzl

Noriyuki Ikeuchi  
Akio Iso  
Piotr Karocki  
Jongyoo Kim  
JaeKeun Kwak  
Sanghoon Lee  
Young Lae Moon

Charles Noetche  
Annette Reilly  
Eugene Stoenmire  
Marcy Stutzman  
Ming Zhang  
Daidi Zhong

When the IEEE-SA Standards Board approved this standard on 26 March 2015, it had the following membership:

### **John Kulick, Chair**

### **Jon Walter Posdahl, Vice Chair**

### **Richard M. Mullen, Past Chair**

### **Konstantinos Karachalios, Secretary**

Masayuki Ariyoshi  
Ted Burse  
Stephen Dukes  
Jean-Philippe Faure  
J. Travis Griffith  
Gary Hoffman  
Michael Janezic

Joseph J. Koepfinger\*  
David J. Law  
Hung Ling  
Andrew Myles  
T. W. Olsen  
Glenn Parsons  
Ronald C. Petersen  
Annette D. Reilly

Stephen J. Shellhammer  
Adrian P. Stephens  
Yatin Trivedi  
Phillip Winston  
Don Wright  
Yu Yuan  
Daidi Zhong

\*Member Emeritus

Patrick Gibbons

*IEEE-SA Content Production and Management*

Soo Kim

*IEEE-SA Operational Program Management*

## Introduction

This introduction is not part of IEEE Std 3333.1.1™-2015, IEEE Standard for Quality of Experience (QoE) and Visual-Comfort Assessments of Three-Dimensional (3D) Contents Based on Psychophysical Studies.

This standard establishes methods of visual discomfort and quality of experience (QoE) assessments of three-dimensional (3D) contents based on psychophysical studies. These key factors are constructed in conjunction with the visual factors used to quantify discomfort and QoE degradation.

## Contents

1. Scope .....	1
2. Normative references .....	1
3. Definitions, abbreviations, and acronyms .....	2
3.1 Definitions .....	2
3.2 Abbreviations and acronyms .....	4
4. Ergonomic requirements and recommendations .....	5
4.1 General .....	5
4.2 Visual saliency prediction .....	5
4.3 Visual contents analysis .....	5
4.4 Subjective assessment .....	5
5. Visual saliency prediction .....	6
5.1 General .....	6
5.2 Human visual system .....	6
5.3 Saliency prediction .....	7
6. Visual-contents analysis .....	14
6.1 General .....	14
6.2 The human visual system .....	14
6.3 Spatial characteristics of 3D contents .....	15
6.4 Temporal characteristics of 3D contents .....	17
7. Subjective assessment .....	23
7.1 General .....	23
7.2 Display device for subjective assessment .....	23
7.3 Continuous assessment methodology .....	23
7.4 Paired comparison methodology .....	28
Annex A (informative) Bibliography .....	33

# IEEE Standard for Quality of Experience (QoE) and Visual-Comfort Assessments of Three-Dimensional (3D) Contents Based on Psychophysical Studies

*IMPORTANT NOTICE: IEEE Standards documents are not intended to ensure safety, security, health, or environmental protection, or ensure against interference with or from other devices or networks. Implementers of IEEE Standards documents are responsible for determining and complying with all appropriate safety, security, environmental, health, and interference protection practices and all applicable laws and regulations.*

*This IEEE document is made available for use subject to important notices and legal disclaimers. These notices and disclaimers appear in all publications containing this document and may be found under the heading “Important Notice” or “Important Notices and Disclaimers Concerning IEEE Documents.” They can also be obtained on request from IEEE or viewed at <http://standards.ieee.org/IPR/disclaimers.html>.*

## 1. Scope

This standard establishes methods for visual saliency prediction, visual contents analysis, and subjective assessment for quantifying the visual discomfort and quality of experience (QoE) of three-dimensional (3D) image and video.

## 2. Normative references

The following referenced documents are indispensable for the application of this document (i.e., they must be understood and used, so each referenced document is cited in text and its relationship to this document is explained). For dated references, only the edition cited applies. For undated references, the latest edition of the referenced document (including any amendments or corrigenda) applies.

ITU-R BT.500-13: Methodology for the subjective assessment of the quality of television pictures.<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> ITU publications are available from Publication Sales, International Telecommunication Union, Place des Nations, 1211 Geneva 20, Switzerland (<http://www.itu.int/>).