

IEEE Guide for Incorporating Human Reliability Analysis into Probabilistic Risk Assessments for Nuclear Power Generating Stations and Other Nuclear Facilities

IEEE Power and Energy Society

Sponsored by the
Nuclear Power Engineering Committee

IEEE Guide for Incorporating Human Reliability Analysis into Probabilistic Risk Assessments for Nuclear Power Generating Stations and Other Nuclear Facilities

Sponsor

**Nuclear Power Engineering Committee
of the
IEEE Power and Energy Society**

Approved 6 December 2017

IEEE-SA Standards Board

Abstract: A structured framework for the incorporation of human reliability analysis (HRA) into probabilistic risk assessments (PRAs) is provided in this guide. To enhance the analysis of human/system interactions in PRAs, to help ensure reproducible conclusions, and to standardize the documentation of such assessments are the purposes of this guide. To do this, a specific HRA framework is developed from standard practices. The HRA framework is neutral with respect to specific HRA methods.

Keywords: HRA, human reliability analysis, IEEE 1082™, PRA, probabilistic risk assessment

The Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, Inc.
515 Alexander Avenue, New York, NY 10016-5997, USA

Copyright © 2018 by The Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, Inc.
All rights reserved. Published 9 April 2018. Printed in the United States of America.

IEEE is a registered trademark in the U.S. Patent & Trademark Office, owned by The Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers, Incorporated.

PDF: ISBN 978-1-5044-4488-0 STD22878
Print: ISBN 978-1-5044-4489-7 STDPD22878

IEEE prohibits discrimination, harassment, and bullying.
For more information, visit <http://www.ieee.org/web/aboutus/whatis/policies/p9-26.html>.

Important Notices and Disclaimers Concerning IEEE Standards Documents

IEEE documents are made available for use subject to important notices and legal disclaimers. These notices and disclaimers, or a reference to this page, appear in all standards and may be found under the heading “Important Notice” or “Important Notices and Disclaimers Concerning IEEE Standards Documents.”

Notice and Disclaimer of Liability Concerning the Use of IEEE Standards Documents

IEEE Standards documents (standards, recommended practices, and guides), both full-use and trial-use, are developed within IEEE Societies and the Standards Coordinating Committees of the IEEE Standards Association (“IEEE-SA”) Standards Board. IEEE (“the Institute”) develops its standards through a consensus development process, approved by the American National Standards Institute (“ANSI”), which brings together volunteers representing varied viewpoints and interests to achieve the final product. Volunteers are not necessarily members of the Institute and participate without compensation from IEEE. While IEEE administers the process and establishes rules to promote fairness in the consensus development process, IEEE does not independently evaluate, test, or verify the accuracy of any of the information or the soundness of any judgments contained in its standards.

IEEE Standards do not guarantee or ensure safety, security, health, or environmental protection, or ensure against interference with or from other devices or networks. Implementers and users of IEEE Standards documents are responsible for determining and complying with all applicable safety, security, environmental, health, and interference protection practices and all applicable laws and regulations.

IEEE does not warrant or represent the accuracy or content of the material contained in its standards, and expressly disclaims all warranties (express, implied and statutory) not included in this or any other document relating to the standard, including, but not limited to, the warranties of: merchantability; fitness for a particular purpose; non-infringement; and quality, accuracy, effectiveness, currency, or completeness of material. In addition, IEEE disclaims any and all conditions relating to: results; and workmanlike effort. IEEE standards documents are supplied “AS IS” and “WITH ALL FAULTS.”

Use of an IEEE standard is wholly voluntary. The existence of an IEEE standard does not imply that there are no other ways to produce, test, measure, purchase, market, or provide other goods and services related to the scope of the IEEE standard. Furthermore, the viewpoint expressed at the time a standard is approved and issued is subject to change brought about through developments in the state of the art and comments received from users of the standard.

In publishing and making the standards available, IEEE is not suggesting or rendering professional or other services for, or on behalf of, any person or entity nor is IEEE undertaking to perform any duty owed by any other person or entity to another. Any person utilizing any IEEE Standards document, should rely upon his or her own independent judgment in the exercise of reasonable care in any given circumstances or, as appropriate, seek the advice of a competent professional in determining the appropriateness of a given IEEE standard.

IN NO EVENT SHALL IEEE BE LIABLE FOR ANY DIRECT, INDIRECT, INCIDENTAL, SPECIAL, EXEMPLARY, OR CONSEQUENTIAL DAMAGES (INCLUDING, BUT NOT LIMITED TO: PROCUREMENT OF SUBSTITUTE GOODS OR SERVICES; LOSS OF USE, DATA, OR PROFITS; OR BUSINESS INTERRUPTION) HOWEVER CAUSED AND ON ANY THEORY OF LIABILITY, WHETHER IN CONTRACT, STRICT LIABILITY, OR TORT (INCLUDING NEGLIGENCE OR OTHERWISE) ARISING IN ANY WAY OUT OF THE PUBLICATION, USE OF, OR RELIANCE UPON ANY STANDARD, EVEN IF ADVISED OF THE POSSIBILITY OF SUCH DAMAGE AND REGARDLESS OF WHETHER SUCH DAMAGE WAS FORESEEABLE.

Translations

The IEEE consensus development process involves the review of documents in English only. In the event that an IEEE standard is translated, only the English version published by IEEE should be considered the approved IEEE standard.

Official statements

A statement, written or oral, that is not processed in accordance with the IEEE-SA Standards Board Operations Manual shall not be considered or inferred to be the official position of IEEE or any of its committees and shall not be considered to be, or be relied upon as, a formal position of IEEE. At lectures, symposia, seminars, conferences, and educational courses, an individual presenting information on IEEE standards shall make it clear that his or her views should be considered the personal views of that individual rather than the formal position of IEEE.

Comments on standards

Comments for revision of IEEE Standards documents are welcome from any interested party, regardless of membership affiliation with IEEE. However, IEEE does not provide consulting information or advice pertaining to IEEE Standards documents. Suggestions for changes in documents should be in the form of a proposed change of text, together with appropriate supporting comments. Since IEEE standards represent a consensus of concerned interests, it is important that any responses to comments and questions also receive the concurrence of a balance of interests. For this reason, IEEE and the members of its societies and Standards Coordinating Committees are not able to provide an instant response to comments or questions except in those cases where the matter has previously been addressed. For the same reason, IEEE does not respond to interpretation requests. Any person who would like to participate in revisions to an IEEE standard is welcome to join the relevant IEEE working group.

Comments on standards should be submitted to the following address:

Secretary, IEEE-SA Standards Board
445 Hoes Lane
Piscataway, NJ 08854 USA

Laws and regulations

Users of IEEE Standards documents should consult all applicable laws and regulations. Compliance with the provisions of any IEEE Standards document does not imply compliance to any applicable regulatory requirements. Implementers of the standard are responsible for observing or referring to the applicable regulatory requirements. IEEE does not, by the publication of its standards, intend to urge action that is not in compliance with applicable laws, and these documents may not be construed as doing so.

Copyrights

IEEE draft and approved standards are copyrighted by IEEE under US and international copyright laws. They are made available by IEEE and are adopted for a wide variety of both public and private uses. These include both use, by reference, in laws and regulations, and use in private self-regulation, standardization, and the promotion of engineering practices and methods. By making these documents available for use and adoption by public authorities and private users, IEEE does not waive any rights in copyright to the documents.

Photocopies

Subject to payment of the appropriate fee, IEEE will grant users a limited, non-exclusive license to photocopy portions of any individual standard for company or organizational internal use or individual, non-commercial use only. To arrange for payment of licensing fees, please contact Copyright Clearance Center, Customer Service, 222 Rosewood Drive, Danvers, MA 01923 USA; +1 978 750 8400. Permission to photocopy portions of any individual standard for educational classroom use can also be obtained through the Copyright Clearance Center.

Updating of IEEE Standards documents

Users of IEEE Standards documents should be aware that these documents may be superseded at any time by the issuance of new editions or may be amended from time to time through the issuance of amendments, corrigenda, or errata. An official IEEE document at any point in time consists of the current edition of the document together with any amendments, corrigenda, or errata then in effect.

Every IEEE standard is subjected to review at least every 10 years. When a document is more than 10 years old and has not undergone a revision process, it is reasonable to conclude that its contents, although still of some value, do not wholly reflect the present state of the art. Users are cautioned to check to determine that they have the latest edition of any IEEE standard.

In order to determine whether a given document is the current edition and whether it has been amended through the issuance of amendments, corrigenda, or errata, visit the IEEE-SA Website at <http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/xpl/standards.jsp> or contact IEEE at the address listed previously. For more information about the IEEE-SA or IEEE's standards development process, visit the IEEE-SA Website at <http://standards.ieee.org>.

Errata

Errata, if any, for all IEEE standards can be accessed on the IEEE-SA Website at the following URL: <http://standards.ieee.org/findstds/errata/index.html>. Users are encouraged to check this URL for errata periodically.

Patents

Attention is called to the possibility that implementation of this standard may require use of subject matter covered by patent rights. By publication of this standard, no position is taken by the IEEE with respect to the existence or validity of any patent rights in connection therewith. If a patent holder or patent applicant has filed a statement of assurance via an Accepted Letter of Assurance, then the statement is listed on the IEEE-SA Website at <http://standards.ieee.org/about/sasb/patcom/patents.html>. Letters of Assurance may indicate whether the Submitter is willing or unwilling to grant licenses under patent rights without compensation or under reasonable rates, with reasonable terms and conditions that are demonstrably free of any unfair discrimination to applicants desiring to obtain such licenses.

Essential Patent Claims may exist for which a Letter of Assurance has not been received. The IEEE is not responsible for identifying Essential Patent Claims for which a license may be required, for conducting inquiries into the legal validity or scope of Patents Claims, or determining whether any licensing terms or conditions provided in connection with submission of a Letter of Assurance, if any, or in any licensing agreements are reasonable or non-discriminatory. Users of this standard are expressly advised that determination of the validity of any patent rights, and the risk of infringement of such rights, is entirely their own responsibility. Further information may be obtained from the IEEE Standards Association.

Participants

At the time this IEEE guide was completed, the IEEE 1082 Working Group had the following membership:

Ronald L. Boring, *Chair*

Andreas Bye	Robert Hall	Pamela Nelson
David R. Desaulniers	Teri Hamlin	Hélène Pesme
Stephen Fleger	Jürgen Hartung	Luca Podofilini
David Gertman	Xuhong He	Claire Taylor
Katrina Groth	Jaroslav Holý	April Whaley

At the time this IEEE guide was completed, the Nuclear Power Engineering committee (NPEC) had the following membership, including corresponding members (CM) and honorary members (HM):

Stephen Fleger, *Chair* **Tom Koshy, *Vice Chair*** **Daryl Harmon, *Secretary*** **George Ballassi, *Past Chair***

Satish Aggarwal	Robert Fuld (CM)	Ken Miller
Iiaz Ahmad	Chris Georgeson	Michael H. Miller
George Attarian	James Gleason	Edward Mohtashemi
Royce Beacom	Dale Goodney	Yasushi Nakagawa
Mark Bowman	Brit Grimm (HM)	Warren R. Odess-Gillett
Daniel Brosnan (CM)	Robert Hall	James Parello (CM)
Keith Bush	David Herrell	Ted Riccio
Robert C. Carruth	Dirk Hopp	Mitchell Staskiewicz
John (Jack) Carter	Greg Hostetter	Rebecca Steinman
Suresh Channarasappa	Steven Hutchins	John Stevens
Paul Colaanni	Gary Johnson	James E. Stoner Jr. (CM)
Tom Crawford	Chris Tenen	Marek Tengler
Dennis Dellinger	Wolfgang Koenig	Sudhir Thakur
David Desaulniers	Robert Konnik	Jim Thomas
John Disosway	James K. Liming	Masafumi Utsumi
Walter Emerson (CM)	Bruce Lord	Yvonne Williams
Kenneth Fleischer	John MacDonald	Paul L. Yanosy Sr.
Robert J. Fletcher	Scott Malcom	Michael Waterman
Robert Francis	Alexander Marion (CM)	John White

The following members of the individual balloting committee voted on this guide. Balloters may have voted for approval, disapproval or abstention.

Satish Aggarwal	Neal Dowling	Yoonik Kim
Robert A. Desaulniers	Donald Dunn	Thomas Koshy
George Ballassi	Stephen Fleger	John Macdonald
H. Stephen Berger	Robert Fuld	Andrew Nack
Ronald L. Boring	Dale Goodney	Michael Newman
Giulavo Brunello	Randall Groves	Warren R. Odess-Gillett
Nissen Burstein	Ajit Gwal	Jan Pirrong
Robert C. Carruth	John Harauz	Raymond Senechal
Tom Crawford	Daryl Harmon	John A. Stevens
Paul Croll	Hamidreza Heidarisaifa	Eugene Stoudenmire
Matthew Davis	Raymond Herb	John Vergis
John Disosway	Werner Hoelzl	Yvonne Williams
Gary Donner	Gary Johnson	Shuhui Zhang

When the IEEE-SA Standards Board approved this guide on 6 December 2017, it had the following membership:

Jean-Philippe Faure, *Chair*
Gary Hoffman, *Vice Chair*
John D. Kulick, *Past Chair*
Konstantinos Karachalios, *Secretary*

Chuck Adams
Masayuki Ariyoshi
Ted Burse
Stephen Dukes
Doug Edwards
J. Travis Griffith
Michael Janezic

Thomas Koshy
Joseph L. Koepfinger*
Kevin Lu
Daleep Mohla
Damir Novosel
Ronald C. Petersen
Annette D. Reilly

Robby Robson
Dorothy Stanley
Adrian Stephens
Mehmet Ulema
Phil Wennblom
Howard Wolfman
Yu Yuan

*Member Emeritus

Introduction

This introduction is not part of IEEE Std 1082-2017, Guide for Incorporating Human Reliability Analysis into Probabilistic Risk Assessments for Nuclear Power Generating Stations and Other Nuclear Facilities.

Any process that requires manual control to minimize public risk will require a high level of human reliability. This reliability can be evaluated through the systematic application of a probabilistic risk assessment (PRA). However, such an assessment requires a detailed understanding of human performance and human reliability methods to form a reasonable reliability estimate.

The initial risk assessment made in the nuclear power plant industry, WASH-1400 [B17], recognized the need for a discipline of human reliability analysis (HRA) to be systematically incorporated within the PRA enterprise.¹ But the methodology—both analyzing human failure events and identifying and incorporating them appropriately in the PRA—was new, incomplete, and in several ways inadequate.

The limitations of the understanding of human reliability in the mid-1970s were vividly demonstrated by the accident at Three Mile Island (TMI). Following TMI, the United States Nuclear Regulatory Commission (NRC), in conjunction with The Institute of Electrical and Electronics Engineers (IEEE), immediately called for a conference on the human factor issues raised by TMI.² This conference has subsequently become a series. Parallel to the initiation of the conference, Subcommittee 7, Human Factors and Control Facilities of the IEEE Nuclear Power Engineering Committee began discussing the standardization of HRA technology. The PRA/HRA interface of incorporating and performing an HRA in the context of a PRA was recognized as the most mature of the efforts of HRA. A guide, the least mandating of the IEEE standards documents, was approved as an IEEE standards project in 1984. The guide was revised in 1997.

This guide outlines the steps necessary to include human reliability in risk assessments. The intent of the guide is not to discuss the details of specific HRA methods, but rather to affirm a method-neutral framework for using a diverse range of HRA methods to support PRA. Since human error has been found to be an important contributor to risk, this guide underscores the systematic integration of the HRA at the earliest stages and throughout the PRA.

Since the 1997 revision of IEEE Std 1082™, there have been significant developments in HRA methods, theories, and practices. A working group (WG) was convened in 2012 to reaffirm the guide. This WG found numerous cases where the 1997 standard contained outdated references or failed to consider now-commonplace aspects of HRA. The WG, however, confirmed the underlying practice of HRA espoused in IEEE Std 1082-1997 is still contemporary and relevant to HRA practice. The WG has updated the guide, to the extent necessary to reflect important advances in HRA. Thus, the framework for conducting HRA found in IEEE Std 1082-1997 remains intact in this revision but has been augmented with references to contemporary issues and practices.

IEEE Std 1082 remains a unique, concise guide for specifying the framework for conducting HRA as part of PRA. Additional standard guidance documents are available beyond IEEE Std 1082. For example, the Electric Power Research Institute (EPRI) released the Systematic Human Action Reliability Procedure (SHARP) and revised SHARP approach [B4], which describes a detailed process of integrating quantitative HRA into PRA, mirroring parts of IEEE Std 1082.³ The American Society of Mechanical Engineers (ASME) has created the Standard for Level 1/Large Early Release Frequency Probabilistic Risk Assessment for Nuclear Power Plant Applications [B1], which outlines high level requirements for HRAs to be included in PRAs. The NRC published Good Practices for Implementing Human Reliability Analysis [B13], which serves as a reference for desirable, but not required aspects of HRA. These three guidelines and numerous recommended practices found in specific HRA methods and texts, complement, but do not replace, IEEE Std 1082. For example, SHARP1 [B4] elaborates on quantifying the HRA for inclusion in PRA but does not include the entire HRA

¹The numbers in brackets correspond to those of the bibliography in Annex B.

²NUREG publications are available from the U.S. Nuclear Regulatory Commission (<http://www.nrc.gov>).

³EPRI publications are available from the Electric Power Research Institute (<http://epri.com>).

process of IEEE Std 1082. The ASME PRA standard [B1] articulates quality requirements for HRA but does not specify how the HRA should be conducted.⁴ NRC's good practices [B13] parallel many aspects of IEEE Std 1082 but does not provide an overall process flow for conducting HRA. IEEE Std 1082 remains relevant as an overarching standard framework for conducting HRA.

IEEE Std 1082 is a method-neutral approach. It is beyond the scope of this guide to enumerate how the guidance can be tied into different HRA methods. Recent reviews of HRA methods may be found in [B1], [B3], [B14], [B15], and [B16]. HRA method development has been extensive, with new approaches that address cognition, context, errors of commission, as well as approaches that span simplified HRA quantification, to dynamic models of human performance. The framework for integrating HRA into PRA as outlined in this guide should apply across HRA methods, although some adaptations may be necessary to meet the unique requirements of specific methods. Such adaptations, especially when using simplified HRA methods, should not come at efficiencies at the expense of performing an integrated and complete HRA process.

⁴ASME publications are available from the American Society of Mechanical Engineers (<http://www.asme.org/>).

Contents

1. Overview.....	11
1.1 Scope.....	11
1.2 Purpose.....	11
2. Definitions, acronyms, and abbreviations	11
2.1 Definitions.....	11
2.2 Acronyms and abbreviations	13
3. Overview of an integrated HRA	13
3.1 General.....	13
3.2 Overall evaluation issues.....	14
3.3 HRA process.....	15
4. Details of the HRA process.....	17
4.1 General	17
4.2 Steps in the human reliability analysis (HRA) process	17
5. Documentation.....	26
5.1 Purpose.....	26
5.2 Structure	26
Annex A (informative) An example for documenting HRA data	28
Annex B (informative) Bibliography	32

IEEE Guide for Incorporating Human Reliability Analysis into Probabilistic Risk Assessments for Nuclear Power Generating Stations and Other Nuclear Facilities

1. Overview

1.1 Scope

This guide provides a structured framework for the incorporation of human reliability analysis (HRA) into probabilistic risk assessments (PRAs).

1.2 Purpose

The purpose of this guide is to enhance the analysis of human-system interactions in PRAs, to help ensure reproducible conclusions, and to standardize the documentation of such assessments. To do this, a specific HRA framework is developed from standard practices to serve as a benchmark to assess alternative ways of incorporating HRA into PRA.

2. Definitions, acronyms, and abbreviations

2.1 Definitions

For the purposes of this document, the following terms and definitions apply. The *IEEE Standards Dictionary Online* should be consulted for terms not defined in this clause.⁵

NOTE—Several terms used in this guide and in the field of HRA are important, yet are ambiguous in common usage or not used frequently enough to be well known. They are defined in this clause for the use in understanding and following this guide.⁶

basic event: An element of the probabilistic risk assessment model for which no further decomposition is performed because it is at the limit of resolution consistent with available data.

⁵*IEEE Standards Dictionary Online* subscription is available at: <http://dictionary.ieee.org>.

⁶Notes in text, tables, and figures of a standard are given for information only and do not contain requirements needed to implement this standard.