



DEVELOPMENT OF AVERAGE  
ISOCHRONOUS STRESS-STRAIN  
CURVES AND EQUATIONS AND  
EXTERNAL PRESSURE CHARTS  
AND EQUATIONS FOR  
9CR-1MO-V STEEL



STP-PT-080

**DEVELOPMENT OF  
AVERAGE ISOCHRONOUS  
STRESS-STRAIN CURVES AND  
EQUATIONS AND EXTERNAL  
PRESSURE CHARTS AND  
EQUATIONS FOR  
9Cr-1Mo-V STEEL**

*Prepared by:*

**MAHJABAD, Ph.D., P.E.**  
Global Engineering & Technology, LLC

**ROBERT SWINDEMAN  
MICHAEL SWINDEMAN, Ph.D.**  
Cromtech, Inc.

**DONALD GRIFFIN, Ph.D.**  
Consultant

**ASME STANDARDS  
TECHNOLOGY, LLC**

Date of Issuance: June 30, 2016

This report was prepared as an account of work sponsored by ASME Pressure Technology Codes & Standards and ASME Standards Technology, LLC (ASME ST-LLC).

Neither ASME, ASME ST-LLC, the author, nor others involved in the preparation or review of this report, nor any of their respective employees, members or persons acting on their behalf, makes any warranty, express or implied, or assumes any legal liability or responsibility for the accuracy, completeness or usefulness of any information, apparatus, product or process disclosed, or represents that its use would not infringe upon privately owned rights.

Reference herein to any specific commercial product, process or service by trade name, trade mark, manufacturer or otherwise does not necessarily constitute or imply its endorsement, recommendation or favoring by ASME ST-LLC or others involved in the preparation or review of this report, or any agency thereof. The views and opinions of the authors, contributors and reviewers of the report expressed herein do not necessarily reflect those of ASME ST-LLC or others involved in the preparation or review of this report, or any agency thereof.

ASME ST-LLC does not take any position with respect to the validity of any patent rights asserted in connection with any items mentioned in this document, and does not undertake to insure anyone utilizing a publication against liability for infringement of any applicable Letters Patent, nor assumes any such liability. Users of a publication are expressly advised that determination of the validity of any such patent rights, and the risk of infringement of such rights, is entirely their own responsibility.

Participation by federal agency representative(s) or person(s) affiliated with industry is not to be interpreted as government or industry endorsement of this publication.

ASME is the registered trademark of the American Society of Mechanical Engineers.

No part of this document may be reproduced in any form,  
in an electronic retrieval system or otherwise,  
without the prior written permission of the publisher.

ASME Standards Technology, LLC  
Two Park Avenue, New York, NY 10016-5990

ISBN No. 978-0-7918-7124-9  
Copyright © 2016 by  
ASME Standards Technology, LLC  
All Rights Reserved

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Foreword.....	v
Summary.....	vi
1 Generation of Creep Models for 9Cr-1Mo-V Steel (grade 91) Isochronous Curves.....	1
1.1 Introduction.....	1
1.2 Logarithmic Creep Rate Formulation.....	1
1.3 Ellis Creep Form.....	3
1.4 Determination of Model Parameters.....	5
1.5 Summary of Model Equations and Coefficients.....	20
1.6 Plasticity.....	21
1.7 Limitations of the Non-Linear Combination Model (NLCM) for Creep.....	24
2 Development of Isochronous Curves and Charts for 9Cr-1Mo-V steels.....	27
2.1 Basic Equations for Generating Isochronous Curves.....	27
2.1.1 Elastic Strain.....	27
2.1.2 Plastic Strain.....	27
2.1.3 Creep Strain.....	28
2.2 Modified Equations for Developing Miscellaneous Isochronous Curves.....	35
2.3 Summary of Procedure.....	39
2.4 Average Isochronous Curves.....	39
Appendix A Conversion of $\alpha_1$ , $\alpha_3$ , $\dot{\epsilon}_0$ , and $\dot{\epsilon}_{01}$ Values.....	41
Appendix B Average Isochronous Stress-Strain Curves at Various Temperatures.....	43
3 Development of External Pressure Charts and Equations.....	75
3.1 External Pressure Curves and Charts Generated from Minimum Isochronous Curves.....	75
3.2 Required Equations for Minimum Isochronous Curves.....	75
3.3 Derivation of the Tangent Modulus Equations, $E_t$ .....	78
3.4 Equations for External Pressure Charts.....	80
3.5 Verification of the Equations Developed for Constructing External Pressure Charts.....	82
3.6 Adjustment of $E_t$ Equations for Modified Isochronous Curves.....	83
3.7 Construction of External Pressure Charts.....	84
Appendix C External Pressure Charts.....	85
4 Design Formulations for Compressive Stress.....	99
4.1 Introduction.....	99
4.2 Axial Compression in Long Cylinders.....	99
4.2.1 Temperature Below the Creep Range.....	99
4.2.2 Temperature in the Creep Range.....	100
4.3 External Pressure on Spherical Sections.....	102
4.3.1 Temperature Below the Creep Range.....	102
4.3.2 Temperature in the Creep Range.....	103
4.4 External Pressure on Cylindrical Shells.....	104
4.4.1 Temperature Below the Creep Range.....	104
4.4.2 Temperature in the Creep Range.....	105
4.5 Axial Compression of Columns (Euler Buckling).....	108
References.....	110

## LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1. Examples of formats of creep data from NIMS.....	7
Figure 1.2. Example fit of a power-law equation to the primary creep portion of the curve.....	8
Figure 1.3. A Larson-Miller representation of the primary creep parameter, $k$ .....	9
Figure 1.4. Isothermal representation of the primary creep stress exponent, $p$ .....	9
Figure 1.5. Temperature dependent term for the primary creep stress exponent.....	10
Figure 1.6. Example of an omega-type fit to the tertiary creep portion of the curve.....	10
Figure 1.7. A Larson-Miller representation of the initial creep rate for tertiary creep.....	12
Figure 1.8. A Larson-Miller representation of the $\alpha$ -parameter for tertiary creep. In general the model slightly over-predicts $\alpha$ for NIMS and under-predicts the $\alpha$ -parameter for the Ellis data set. The values do not extrapolate well to low stresses.....	13
Figure 1.9. Comparison of ASME FFS-1 (API-579) initial creep rates with values found in the present study. ASME FFS-1 would slightly under-predict the present data set. The extrapolation to low stresses is uncertain.....	14
Figure 1.10. Comparison of ASME FFS-1 (API-579) parametric equation for Omega with the $\alpha$ -parameters found in the present study. ASME FFS-1 would under predict the present data set.....	15
Figure 1.11. Example of comparisons of individual data fits to the overall curve.....	16
Figure 1.12. Example of the NLCM with primary creep adjusted to match data.....	17
Figure 1.13. A Larson-Miller expression for Creep Rate at 0.1 hr based on Power-Law fit to primary creep portion of curve.....	17
Figure 1.14. A Larson-Miller expression for the $\alpha_1$ parameter based on consistency of time to rupture and estimated initial creep rate.....	18
Figure 1.15. Example of the NLCM global fit.....	18
Figure 1.16. Example of the NLCM global fit.....	19
Figure 1.17. Example of the NLCM global fit.....	19
Figure 1.18. Example of the NLCM global fit.....	20
Figure 1.19. Fit of modified Voce equation to typical data.....	24
Figure 1.20. Calculated minimum strength tensile curve.....	24
Figure 2.1. Average Isochronous curve at 1070°F and 75 hours.....	33
Figure 2.2. Isochronous curves for 1000°F and 10,000 hours.....	35
Figure 2.3. Isochronous curves for 1000°F and 5 hours.....	38
Figure 2.4. Comparison of an isochronous curve obtained from the methodology in this report versus that in ASME-FFS-1.....	39
Figure 3.1. Isochronous curves.....	78
Figure 3.2. External pressure chart at 1065°F and 37,000 hours.....	82
Figure 4.1. External pressure chart.....	100
Figure 4.2. Geometric chart (ASME).....	107

## FOREWORD

The purpose of this project is to develop isochronous stress-strain curves and external pressure charts in the creep regime for 9Cr-1Mo-V steel taking into consideration updated information and data available in the literature. The temperature range is 800°F to 1200°F. The time range is Hot Tensile up to 300,000 hours. The project is divided into four parts in order to accomplish the required tasks.

PART 1. In this part creep model equations are generated for 9Cr-1Mo-V steel. The equations and applicable current data are gathered from many sources as detailed and explained in this part.

PART 2. The physical data of Part 1 are converted in this part to equation form and combined with the stress-strain creep model equations in order to have a unified system usable for generating isochronous curves. Examples are given to demonstrate the feasibility of generating isochronous curves directly from equations for any temperature and time within the scope of this project. Isochronous stress-strain charts are also drawn for reference purposes.

PART 3. In this part equations are developed for the purpose of constructing external pressure curves and charts for the 9Cr-1Mo-V steel. These curves and charts, which are constructed from equations for various temperatures and times, are verified for accuracy against charts drawn directly from the isochronous curves by the graphical and finite difference methods.

PART 4. The equations derived in this part for designing components in the creep regime are applicable to all materials. They are included in this report to show the integration of design equations with equations used to construct external pressure curves in the creep range.

Reference is made throughout this document to the ASME BPV Section III-NH Code. Presently all of the current contents in III-NH are also in Section III, Division 5 of the ASME BPV Code for nuclear class NB applications. However, it should be noted that Section III-NH is slated for elimination in the middle of 2017. At that time the material tables and charts in III-NH will be transferred to the ASME BPV Code Section II-D. Similarly, a revised text of the rules in III-NH will appear in ASME Code Case 2843 for Section VIII applications.

The authors extend their thanks to various members of ASME BPV I, II, III, and VIII Committees for their support of this project. It is hoped that the results generated in this report will benefit all of these codes. Special thanks are given to Dr. Kevin Javad for obtaining the derivatives of some of the complicated equations in PART 3 of the report. Thanks are also given to reviewers Dr. Peter Carter, Mr. Don Kurle, Mr. Benjamin Hantz, Dr. John Grubb, and Mr. Robert Mikitka for their thoughtful comments and to Ms. Colleen O'Brien and Mr. Steve Rossi of ASME for coordinating various phases of this project.

Established in 1880, the American Society of Mechanical Engineers (ASME) is a professional not-for-profit organization with more than 135,000 members and volunteers promoting the art, science and practice of mechanical and multidisciplinary engineering and allied sciences. ASME develops codes and standards that enhance public safety, and provides lifelong learning and technical exchange opportunities benefiting the engineering and technology community. Visit [www.asme.org](http://www.asme.org) for more information.

ASME Standards Technology, LLC (ASME ST-LLC) is a not-for-profit Limited Liability Company, with ASME as the sole member, formed in 2004 to carry out work related to new and developing technology. The ASME ST-LLC mission includes meeting the needs of industry and government by providing new standards-related products and services, which advance the application of emerging and newly commercialized science and technology, and providing the research and technology development needed to establish and maintain the technical relevance of codes and standards. Visit [www.stllc.asme.org](http://www.stllc.asme.org) for more information.

## SUMMARY

The following tasks are accomplished for this project.

1. Isochronous stress-strain equations are developed for 9Cr-1Mo-V steel that take into account the elastic, plastic, and creep strain - prepared by Robert W. Swindeman and Michael J. Swindeman, Ph.D.
2. Isochronous stress-strain charts are developed from equations for 9Cr-1Mo-V steel. The temperature coverage is 800°F to 1200°F in increments of 50°F. Curves in the charts cover time increments of Hot Tensile, 1 hour, 10 hours, 100 hours, 1000 hours, 10,000 hours, 100,000 hours, and 300,000 hours. In addition, equations are given to assist in plotting individual curves at any temperature and time within the scope of this project – prepared by Maan H. Jawad, Ph.D., P.E.
3. External pressure charts are generated from isochronous stress-strain equations for 9Cr-1Mo-V steel. The temperature coverage is 800°F to 1200°F in increments of 100°F. Curves in the charts cover time increments of Hot Tensile, 10 hours, 100 hours, 1000 hours, 10,000 hours, 100,000 hours, and 300,000 hours. In addition, equations are given to assist in plotting individual external pressure curves at any temperature and time within the scope of this project – prepared by Maan H. Jawad, Ph.D., P.E. and Donald Griffin, Ph.D.
4. Equations are developed for designing components in the creep range under compressive stress for all materials. The equations cover axial compression in cylinders, external pressure in spherical components, external pressure in cylindrical shells, and axial compression in structural columns (Euler's buckling) – prepared by Maan H. Jawad, Ph.D., P.E. and Donald Griffin, Ph.D.

**ABBREVIATIONS AND ACRONYMS (PART 1)**

- A = Parameter in the Ellis form of the creep equation, essentially the Monkman-Grant strain (mm/mm)
- $a_0, a_1, a_2, a_3$  = Coefficients used in a Larson-Miller parametric expression
- $\alpha$  = Creep rate acceleration term used in fitting the tertiary portion of the curve in the Ellis Model
- $\alpha_1$  = Creep rate deceleration term used in fitting the primary creep portion of the curve
- $\alpha_3$  = Creep rate acceleration term used in fitting the tertiary portion of the curve
- B = Parameter in the Ellis form of the Creep Equation (1/hour)
- (1/b) = a factor in the Voce equation adjusted to force the yield curve to pass through the Y-1,  $S_{y1}$ , or  $S_{ys}$  (%)
- C = term in the Larson-Miller parametric expression, corresponding to the Larson-Miller Constant
- $\Delta$  = an increment of stress that represents the difference between the minimum and average plastic flow curves and is equal to 0.25 Y-1 or 0.25  $S_{y1}$
- $e_p$  = plastic strain (%)
- $\epsilon$  = Creep strain for any stage of the creep curve
- $\epsilon_1$  = Primary component of creep strain in a linear combined model
- $\epsilon_3$  = Tertiary component of creep strain in a linear combined model
- $\epsilon_c$  = Combined primary and tertiary creep
- $\epsilon_r$  = Total creep strain at rupture
- $\dot{\epsilon}$  = Creep strain rate (1/hour)
- $\dot{\epsilon}_0$  = Initial creep rate based on a fit to the tertiary stage of the creep curve in the Ellis Model (1/hour)
- $\dot{\epsilon}_{03}$  = Initial creep rate based on a fit to the tertiary stage of the creep curve (1/hour)
- $\dot{\epsilon}_1$  = Creep rate (1/hour)
- $\dot{\epsilon}_{01}$  = Initial creep rate based on a fit to the primary stage of the creep curve
- F = Parameter used in the Ellis Model, the integration constant, which is related to the total initial creep strain at time  $t = 0$
- K = Coefficient in the Andrade form for primary creep ( $1/\text{hr}^{p+1}$ )
- p = Time exponent in the Andrade form for primary creep, normally 1/3
- $S_{pl}$  = proportional limit of tensile curve, minimum, average, or typical curve of concern (ksi)
- $S_u$  = stress value from Table NH-3225.1 in Section III Subsection NH which covers temperatures above 1000°F (ksi)
- $S_{uts}$  = ultimate tensile strength of an “average” curve (ksi)
- $S_{ys}$  = 0.2% offset yield strength of the “average” curve (ksi)
- $S_{y1}$  = Stress value from Table 14.5 in Section III Subsection NH which covers temperatures Above 1000°F (ksi)
- $\sigma$  = Applied Stress (MPa)
- t = Time at a specific stress (hours)
- $t_{er}$  = Time to reach rupture strain (hours)
- $t_r$  = Rupture time (hours)
- $(t_r)_3$  = Rupture time based on a fit to the tertiary portion of the curve (hours)
- T = Temperature (°C)
- U = stress value from Table U in ASME BPVC Section II Part D which covers temperatures to 1000°F (ksi)
- Y-1 = stress value from Table Y-1 in ASME BPVC Section II Part D which covers temperatures to 1000°F (ksi)

# 1 GENERATION OF CREEP MODELS FOR 9CR-1MO-V STEEL (GRADE 91) ISOCHRONOUS CURVES

## 1.1 Introduction

The intent of this report is to describe the development of a creep model for use in producing isochronous curves for grade 91. The basis for the other component of strain, the plasticity or “hot tensile” curve, has been described elsewhere. Values of creep strain are needed over a wide range of conditions. At some temperatures, stresses, and times, the creep strain is dominated by the primary component; at other conditions tertiary creep is important. The model must in some cases be predictive of conditions for which there are no available data, specifically estimating creep strains at very low stresses, high temperature, and long times.

In describing the model, we try to maintain a distinction between terms such as condition, parameter, constant, and coefficient. The conditions are the inputs to the model: stress, temperature, and time. The parameters of the model are the values that are used to describe the shape of the creep curve at a specific set of conditions. For example, the stress exponent,  $n$ , is a parameter, and the time to rupture,  $t_r$ , may also be considered a parameter. The model coefficients are used in describing the parameters as functions of stress and temperature. The term constant is only used for specific coefficients that take on a special role in a time-temperature parameterization. In this report, the term constant is exclusively used for the Larson-Miller constant. It is highly desirable to keep the number of parameters low to minimize the effort of determining the coefficients.

Many have come to view the classic three stage description of creep as the result of a primary stage where hardening mechanisms result in diminishing creep rates and a tertiary creep stage where damage and aging mechanisms produce an increasing creep rate. The secondary stage, where creep rate appears to be constant, is simply the transition between the two stages. Primary-tertiary forms for creep models often involve four parameters, two each for the primary and tertiary stages.

To determine these parameters, three approaches are possible. The first is to fit the entire curve. This can be quite difficult depending on the creep model since it involves non-linear regression. The second is to fit either the tertiary creep or primary creep and then make adjustments for the missing component. The third is to fit each separately and look for a method to combine the curves. The model proposed below seeks to use information contained within the tertiary creep portion of the curve to provide an estimate of the primary creep strain.

## 1.2 Logarithmic Creep Rate Formulation

### Description of Tertiary Creep

The model expression for tertiary creep is<sup>1</sup>

$$\ln(\dot{\epsilon}) = \ln(\dot{\epsilon}_{03}) + \alpha_3 \epsilon \quad (1.1)$$

where  $\epsilon$  is the creep strain,  $\dot{\epsilon}$  is the creep strain rate,  $\dot{\epsilon}_{03}$  represents the initial creep rate at zero strain and  $\alpha_3$  provides the dependence of the strain rate on the creep strain. In the present paper, we refer to this form of the creep law as the logarithmic-rate form.

<sup>1</sup> The use of the term  $\alpha$  is intentional and is used to distinguish the resultant values in the present approach from those values tabulated for aged material in ASME FFS-1 / API-579.