ASME STANDARDS TECHNOLOGY, LLC

STP-NU-061-1

Comprehensive Evaluation of the NSQ-100 Nuclear Safety and Quality Management System Requirements

STP-NU-061-1

COMPREHENSIVE EVALUATION OF THE NSQ-100 NUCLEAR SAFETY AND QUALITY MANAGEMENT SYSTEM REQUIREMENTS

Prepared by:

William K. Sowder, PH.D.
Quality Management Services Co., LLC

ASME STANDARDS TECHNOLOGY, LLC

Date of Issuance: June 30, 2015

This report was prepared as an account of work sponsored by ASME Nuclear Codes and Standards and ASME Standards Technology, LLC (ASME ST-LLC).

ASME Standards Technology, LLC
Two Park Avenue, New York, NY 10016-5990

ISBN No. 978-0-7918-6907-9

Summary of Changes
June 2015

STP-NU-061-1

COMPREHENSIVE EVALUATION OF THE NSQ-100 NUCLEAR SAFETY AND QUALITY MANAGEMENT SYSTEM REQUIREMENTS OF ASME NQA-1

The following changes have been made to the first revision of STP-NU-06.

Annex A

ASME NQA-1–2012
General change to all 18 NQA sections lead pages, from "100 Basic" to "100 General"

Page 13 Requirement 1, 201 General (c) quality achievement is verified by those not directly responsible for performing the work

Page 15-20 Requirement 2, 100 General deletion of "The program shall identify the activities and items to which it applies."

Page 24 Requirement 3 revise first paragraph "The design shall be defined, controlled, and verified."

Page 30 Requirement 3, 300 Design Verification, revise and add to (a) paragraph "This verification may be performed by the originator's supervisor, provided *(1)* the supervisor did not specify a singular design approach or rule out certain design considerations and did not establish the design inputs used in the design; or *(2)* the supervisor is the only individual in the organization competent to perform the verification. Cursory supervisory reviews do not satisfy the intent of this Standard."

Page 62 Requirement 12 303 Control delete paragraph "Methods and frequency of checking accuracy shall be defined in procedures."

Annex B

ASME NQA-1 2012
General change to all 18 NQA sections lead pages, from "100 Basic" to "100 General"

Page 82 Requirement 1, 201 General (c) quality achievement is verified by those not directly responsible for performing the work

Page 84 Requirement 2, 100 General deletion of "The program shall identify the activities and items to which it applies."

Page 92 Requirement 3 100 General revise first paragraph "The design shall be defined, controlled, and verified."

Page 98 Requirement 3 500 Design Verification, revise and add to (a) paragraph "This verification may be performed by the originator's supervisor, provided *(1)* the supervisor did not specify a singular design approach or rule out certain design considerations and did not establish the design inputs used in the design; or *(2)* the supervisor is the only individual in the organization competent to perform the verification. Cursory supervisory reviews do not satisfy the intent of this Standard."

Annex C

ASME Section III

Page 149-150 NCA-4134.2 Subparagraph (c) revised

Page 189-190 NCA-4134.6 revised

Page 232 NCA-4134.17 New subpara. (e) added; former subpara. (e) redesignated as (f)

ASME NQA-1 2012
General change to all 18 NQA sections lead pages, from "100 Basic" to "100 General"

Page 147 Requirement 1, 201 General (c) quality achievement is verified by those not directly responsible for performing the work

Page 149-152 Requirement 2, 100 General deletion of "The program shall identify the activities and items to which it applies."

Page 162 Requirement 3 100 General revise first paragraph "The design shall be defined, controlled, and verified.

Page 169 Requirement 3 500 Design Verification, revise and add to (a) paragraph "This verification may be performed by the originator's supervisor, provided *(1)* the supervisor did not specify a singular design approach or rule out certain design considerations and did not establish the design inputs used in the design; or *(2)* the supervisor is the only individual in the organization competent to perform the verification. Cursory supervisory reviews do not satisfy the intent of this Standard."

Page 219 Requirement 12 303 Control delete paragraph "Methods and frequency of checking accuracy shall be defined in procedures."

Page 229 Requirement 17, SubSection 100 General delete 4th paragraph "The term records, used throughout this section, is to be interpreted as quality assurance records"

Annex D

ASME Section III NCA 2013, Subsections 3850

Page 245	NCA-3853.1 Subparagraph (d)
Page 250	NCA-3853.3 First sentence revised
Page 251-252	NCA-3855.5 (1) Subparagraphs (a), (a)(1), and (a)(3) revised; New subpara. (a)(4) added and subsequent subparagraph redesignated
Page 256-257	NCA-3856.3 Subparagraphs (c) and (e) revised

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Foreword vii
Abstract viii
Abbreviations and Acronyms ix
1 PURPOSE AND SCOPE 1
2 NQSA ORGANIZATIONAL SUPPORT STRUCTURE 2
3 DIFFERENCES OF STANDARD DEVELOPMENT ORGANIZATIONS 3
4 IMPORTANT DIFFERENCE IN FOCUS OF REVIEWED DOCUMENTS 4
5 EVALUATION RESULTS 5
6 SUMMARY OF EVALUATION AND ASSESSMENT RESULTS 7
References 8
Annex A—NQA-1-2012 and NSQ-100 Comparison 9
Annex B—NQA-1-2012 and NSQ-100 Certification Comparison 75
Annex C—Certification Requirements Between Section III NCA 4100 and NSQ-100 143
Annex D—Certification Comparison Section III NCA 3850 and NSQ-100 242

FOREWORD

This technical report was developed to comprehensively evaluate the NSQ-100 document and its related guidance documents against the corresponding ASME products. Comparisons were made of the various corresponding documents of ASME and the Nuclear Quality Standard Association (NQSA). The report discusses the competitive strengths and weaknesses of the NSQ-100 products compared to the corresponding ASME products.

Established in 1880, the American Society of Mechanical Engineers (ASME) is a professional not-for-profit organization with more than 135,000 members and volunteers promoting the art, science and practice of mechanical and multidisciplinary engineering and allied sciences. ASME develops codes and standards that enhance public safety, and provides lifelong learning and technical exchange opportunities benefiting the engineering and technology community. Visit www.asme.org for more information.

The ASME Standards Technology, LLC (ASME ST-LLC) is a not-for-profit Limited Liability Company, with ASME as the sole member, formed in 2004 to carry out work related to newly commercialized technology. The ASME ST-LLC mission includes meeting the needs of industry and government by providing new standards-related products and services, which advance the application of emerging and newly commercialized science and technology and providing the research and technology development needed to establish and maintain the technical relevance of codes and standards. Visit www.stllc.asme.org for more information.